

Impact case study (REF3b)

<p>Institution: Birmingham City University</p>
<p>Unit of Assessment: UoA 22 – Social Work and Social Policy</p>
<p>Title of case study: The role of the Arts in Criminal Justice</p>
<p>1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words) This case study refers to the work of the Centre for Applied Criminology (CAC) in investigating the role of the Arts in Criminal Justice. The research plays a significant role in critically exploring the relationship between the Arts and the Criminal Justice System (CJS) and can claim the following impacts:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Effects on policy and practice of HM Prison Service of England and Wales. * Effects on the practice of Arts programmes working with offenders. * Effects on the methodological approach in evidencing outcomes in programme evaluations. * Greater awareness and understanding of the Arts within and beyond criminal justice
<p>2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words) CAC's research relating to this case study has explored the role of the Arts in both shaping representations of offenders and as part of the rehabilitative process. The research has encompassed drama, art, music and film. The funding of Arts-based interventions with offenders has been subject to much scrutiny – often referred to as the 'public acceptability test' - particularly since the turbulent funding environment that has followed on from the 2008 economic crisis. Against the background of some official (for example, Prison Service Instruction 50 'Publically Acceptable Activities in Prison' [PSI-50], which was later rescinded with recognition of the value of the Arts) and tabloid media concerns about the acceptability of prison Arts projects, this research has been central in promoting their legitimacy. This strand of our work embodies CAC's strategic aim - to generate applied research that recognises and responds to the needs of stakeholders in and around the CJS, and all three strategic objectives - to promote a better public understanding of the CJS; improve the operation of the CJS within specific agencies and institutions; and enable offenders to tackle barriers to desistance.</p> <p>The research developed from 2004, building on foundations laid by CAC's Prison Film Project. This project, led by Professor Wilson, was funded by a grant from the Esmee Fairbairn Foundation as part of its Rethinking Crime and Punishment initiative. The project organised weekend prison film festivals in three cities – London, Glasgow and Birmingham. This early work represented the use of an Arts medium to increase public understanding of issues of imprisonment and used issues portrayed in prison films to inform current debate on punishment. An authored book, <i>Images of Incarceration: Representations of Prison in Film and Television Drama</i> (Wilson & O'Sullivan, 2004 - see section 3) formed part of the project and the research was the subject of an article in <i>Theoretical Criminology</i>, a prestigious criminology journal (Wilson and O'Sullivan, 2005 – see section 3),</p> <p>Dr Caulfield led the research between 2008 and 2012 as it expanded to explore the impact of Arts based rehabilitative initiatives upon offenders. Music programmes in prisons have been a central theme throughout the assessment period, with CAC commissioned to evaluate two such initiatives. Much of this work has focused upon the use of Gamelan music in working with both male and female offenders. A Gamelan is a collection of instruments consisting mainly of gongs, metallophones (instruments with rows of tuned metal bars that are struck with mallets) and drums. Gamelan players learn by mastering techniques and memorising the music. The approach originates from Bali and Java and at its centre is an emphasis on community over individual values - the musicians play as a group and pass on techniques to each other.</p> <p>The use of drama through games and role play has also formed part of CAC's research portfolio, largely through a commissioned evaluation of the 'Talent 4' initiative at HMP YOI Drake Hall, HMP Sudbury and HMYOI Brinsford. Talent 4 is designed to help offenders define professional career choices and thereby increase their employability. It is delivered by Rideout (Creative Arts for Rehabilitation) a third sector organisation drawing on innovative, arts-based approaches to working with prisoners and prison staff.</p> <p>In addition, the role of art as a recreational activity in offender rehabilitation has also been a key theme and a key piece of research in this regard is the work focusing upon HMP Grendon's Artist in Residence – the only such initiative in a prison in England and Wales. The research consists of a commissioned evaluation of the Artist in Residence, detailed in project report for the Motesiczky Charitable Trust (Caulfield, 2011).</p> <p>Knowledge generated by the above work is currently being shared through an ESRC Seminar Series (2012-2014) entitled 'Enrichment activities? Arts, creativity and spirituality in criminal justice</p>

Impact case study (REF3b)

systems', which is being led by Dr Caulfield – Birmingham City University hosted the first seminar in the series in November 2012, at which Professor Wilson gave the key note address.

Key researchers

Atherton, S. Research Assistant (2005-2008).

Caulfield, L. Senior Lecturer in Psychology (2007-2013).

Henley, J. PhD student (2004-2010).

O'Sullivan, S. Lecturer in Sociology (1995-2005).

Wilkinson, D. PhD student (2007-2011).

Wilson, D. Professor of Criminology and Founding Director of the Centre for Applied Criminology (1997 – ongoing).

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

Caulfield, L.S. (2011). *An evaluation of the Artist in Residence at HMP Grendon*. Final grant report to the Motesiczky Charitable Trust.

Caulfield, L.S. & Wilson, D. (2013). The role of the Arts as an intervention with offenders in prison. In P. Jones (Ed.) *Interventions in Criminal Justice: A handbook for counsellors and therapists working in the criminal justice system*. Brighton: Pavilion Publishing, pp. 45-58.

Henley, J., Caulfield, L. S., Wilson, D. & Wilkinson, D. (2012). Good Vibrations: positive change through social music-making, *Music Education Research*, 14(4), pp. 499-520.

Wilson, D & O'Sullivan, S (2004). *Images of Incarceration: Representations of Prison in Film and Television Drama*, Winchester: Waterside Press.

Wilson, D. & O'Sullivan, S. (2005). Re-theorizing the penal reform functions of the prison film. *Theoretical Criminology*, 9(4), pp. 471-491.

The quality of the research can be evidenced by the fact that the above journal articles, book chapter and authored book have all been subject to rigorous peer review processes. Wilson & O'Sullivan (2004) also received favourable reviews from practitioners and academics, with, the then Deputy Governor of HMP Gartree commenting that the book was "a major theoretical foundation, a huge step forward in understanding the media depiction of corrections... The authors show how on both sides of the Atlantic, the representation of prisons has changed over time and how this relates to penal realities". A Cardiff University criminologist, in the peer reviewed journal *Crime Media Culture*, additionally stated, "Images of Incarceration provides a useful overview on the chronology of the prison film, and raises a number of important questions regarding the relationship between prison drama and consequent audience consumption. The authors' decision to embrace a broad definition of what constitutes a prison drama consequently challenges the boundaries of the existing corpus of prison cinema providing opportunities for future work in this field".

In addition, the research led by Dr Caulfield on the role of the arts in prisons has been recognised for its exceptional quality in that she was presented with a commendation award from the Howard League for Penal Reform in 2011. Dr Caulfield was commended having been shortlisted for the Howard League Research Medal. This prestigious award saw Dr Caulfield's work with CAC listed alongside other leading criminologists working in the field of desistance, such as Professor Shadd Maruna.

Further testament is the ESRC seminar series noted above, that developed as a result of the high quality of the work and its applied and collaborative nature across academia and the third sector.

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

CAC's research into the role of the Arts in criminal justice has generated impact characterised by both reach and significance, which we have detailed below through reference to a range of outcomes encompassing various audiences and user groups.

In the face of concerns about the public acceptability of Arts projects in prisons, CAC's research has been instrumental in establishing and maintaining a good reputation for such projects within the CJS through provision of robust, rigorous evidence of their effectiveness.

In 2008, PSI-50 was published by National Offender Management Services (NOMS). As a result of this, HM Prison Service - and in particular individual prison governors - became wary of inviting external arts organisations to work in their prisons. Consequently, the Arts Alliance (hereafter 'AA' - the national body for promoting arts in the Criminal Justice System) launched a campaign against PSI-50, using, amongst other evidence, CACs research on the Arts to demonstrate their value. The Manager of

Impact case study (REF3b)

the AA has stated with reference to CAC's research, "*The provision of robust evidence for the benefit of the Arts Alliance in demonstrating the impact of arts programmes in the rehabilitation of offenders is useful in making our case when trying to influence the wider policy debate. We hold regular meetings with key policy makers at the Ministry of Justice (MoJ) and the National Offender Management Services (NOMS), where such evidence is crucial*". In addition, the Manager of the AA has further stated, "*The report co-authored by Dr Laura Caulfield and David Wilson about Good Vibrations music project: Continuing Positive Change in Prison and Community (2010), is quoted in a paper, which will be taken to the 'Beyond Employability' Round Table event hosted by Prisoner Education Trust on 26th June (2013). Having robust evidence such as this is the key to enabling arts interventions to continue in criminal justice settings and communities and is hugely valuable to our membership*". In 2010 the then Justice Minister Crispin Blunt, in rescinding PSI-50, stated 'We recognise that Arts activities can play a valuable role in helping offenders to address issues such as communication problems and low self-esteem and enabling them to engage in programmes that address their offending behaviour'.

CAC has continued to generate impact through the AA in providing evidence of improved offender outcomes. The AA Evidence Directory – an online repository of research and evaluation, includes CAC projects. Dr Caulfield served as an advisor on the AA Evidence Advisory Group from April 2011-December 2012, consulting on collating, enhancing, reviewing, and disseminating the evidence base for the Arts.

A measure of the impact of the research is gauged by its promotion in a range of professional and academic arenas. For example, Caulfield was invited to present findings relating to a 2008 evaluation of Gamelan music projects (Funded by the Firebird Trust) at the AA launch conferences in 2009 and a subsequent AA conference in 2010, which attracted an audience of government and prison service officials, as well as Arts practitioners and others.

In 2011 the research was identified in Research Councils UK *Big Ideas for the Future* report, a publicly available document outlining 100 examples of excellent research from all fields including science, engineering, social sciences, medicine and the arts and humanities. The report focused on research taking place in 2011 and explored what it might mean in 20 years' time. This demonstrates not only impact of reach and significance in the assessment period but validates this strand of our research as a foundation upon which to generate future impact.

Dr Caulfield's 2011 evaluation of the Artist in Residence at HMP Grendon, commissioned by the Marie-Louise von Motesiczky (MVLM) Charitable Trust, resulted in the residency being extended for a further two years (2012 and 2013), demonstrating effects on and benefits to practice within the prison and benefits to opportunities available to HMP Grendon prisoners. The Chair of the MLVM Charitable Trust has stated, "*The evaluation demonstrated the impact of the artist in residence programme to date. This in turn was the basis for the MLVM Charitable Trust's decision to fund the programme for a further two year phase*". The recreational art group built around the Artist in Residence currently has places for 15 prisoners and resulted in 107 entries being made to the Koestler Trust Exhibition in 2013 – the highest number of entries from the prison in its history. Of note, the work of the artist and the prisoners with whom she worked will be exhibited at the offices of the Guardian in March 2014.

In addition, outcomes measures for prison-based arts programmes developed by CAC were cited as an example of good practice by CLINKS and the Charities Evaluation Service in their publicly available guidance report entitled *Demonstrating the Value of Arts in Criminal Justice* (Ellis & Gregory, 2011), This report directly addressed concerns by NOMS that the Arts should aim to collect robust evidence. The inclusion of CAC research in the report demonstrates reach amongst third sector organisations and significance in terms of influence upon the practice of outcomes measurement in prison-based arts activities.

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

1. Corroborating statement, Chair of the Marie-Louise von Motesiczky Charitable Trust (Participant in the process of impact delivery – research evaluation commissioner).
2. Corroborating statement, Manager, Arts Alliance.
3. Angus McLewin Associates. (2011). *Arts Alliance Evidence Library*. London: Arts Alliance and CLINKS. Available at: http://api.ning.com/files/DfWrum2fPRIA1gPdI-4hUlvVQ1*XIY7SZM*yXkdicfmpnfzdblpfze15-yor5nME-naHXqguprdiAMC6PbaBYq9BSDmLtY/80256_Evidence_Guide.pdf
4. Ellis, J. & Gregory, T. (2011). *Demonstrating the Value of Arts in Criminal Justice*. York: CLINKS and

Impact case study (REF3b)

Charities	Evaluation	Service.	Available	at:
			http://www.artsalliance.org.uk/sites/default/files/clinks_aa_demonstrating-value_FINAL_SECURE.pdf	
5. Esmee Fairbairn Foundation.	(2004).	<i>Rethinking Crime and Punishment: The Report.</i>	London:	Esmee Fairbairn Foundation. Available at: http://esmeefairbairn.org.uk/news-and-learning/publications/rethinking-crime--punishmentthe-report
6. ESRC.	(2013).	<i>Successful Seminar Applications 2011-2012</i>	[online].	Available at: http://www.esrc.ac.uk/funding-and-guidance/statistics/research-seminars/seminars2011-12.aspx
7. Howard League for Penal Reform	(2013).	<i>Research Medal 2011.</i>	Available	at: http://www.howardleague.org/research-medal-2011/
8. Research Councils UK.	(2011).	<i>Big Ideas for the Future: UK research that will have a profound effect on our future.</i>	RCUK: London.	Available at: http://www.rcuk.ac.uk/Publications/reports/Pages/BigIdeas.aspx