

Institution: University of Manchester

Unit of Assessment: 32 (Philosophy)

a. Overview

Over the REF period, the philosophy unit has

- Nearly tripled its research grant income
- Received grants from a wide range of sources: Research Councils, UK industry and commerce, charities, and the European Commission
- Secured significant investment with two major recent appointments: Tim Bayne as professor and Helen Beebee as the Samuel Hall Chair
- Consolidated and expanded graduate numbers, more than doubling the average annual number of graduate research awards

The present submission includes 13 Category A staff, of whom 7 are professors (**Bayne**, **Beebee**, **Daly**, **Dodd**, **MacDonald**, **O'Neill**, **Uebel**), 4 senior lecturers (**Abell**, **Liggins**, **Scott**, **Stevens**), and 2 lecturers (**Smith**, **Whittle**). Also mentioned in this document is Professor Peter Goldie, the Samuel Hall Chair in Philosophy until his death in October 2011. The Philosophy unit is a distinct discipline area within the School of Social Sciences which is part of the Faculty of Humanities.

b. Research strategy

The University of Manchester has an ambitious strategic plan, published as *Manchester 2020* in November 2011, to become one of the world's top 25 research universities by 2020. The Philosophy unit intends to fully contribute to this aim by meeting the following objectives:

- 1. Achieving a substantial growth in its research grant and contract (RGC) income.
- 2. The creation and development of collaborative research groups both within the unit and with other partners.
- 3. Organising active seminar series, workshops and reading groups and hosting major international conferences.
- 4. Developing a large, thriving cohort of high-quality PGR students.
- 5. Continuing to focus on consistently producing world-class research publications and maximising the impact of the unit's research.

To meet these aims the Philosophy unit has continued to develop particular areas of specialisation. These areas, initially agreed upon in October 2005 and documented in RAE 2008, were metaphysics, the philosophy of psychology, the history of 20th century philosophy, aesthetics and epistemology. This strategy has met with substantial success, with important publications in these areas, international conferences, several workshops, the attraction of graduate students to these areas of interest. The unit has also secured a number of grants (ranging from £10.000 to well over £1 million) that, in addition to being a central objective itself, have been a primary mechanism for meeting other key strategic aims such as supporting conferences, funding research students at both PhD and postdoctoral level, expanding research groups and developing expertise in the areas of specialisation. For example, in the philosophy of psychology there have been notable research monographs by Goldie (The Mess Inside, OUP) and Bayne (The Unity of Consciousness, OUP), papers by **Bayne** in *Journal of Philosophy*, *Philosophical Quarterly* and by **Smith** in *Philosophy* and Phenomenological Research. Additionally, **Bayne** is PI on The Architecture of Consciousness, a large grant ERC funded project beginning in 2013 and continuing to 2018, awarded €1,477,483; two postdoctoral researchers will be employed over the course of this project. In the area of metaphysics, Helen **Beebee** was recently appointed to the Samuel Hall Chair in Philosophy, and major research outputs include **Beebee**'s work on laws of nature in *Noûs* and **Whittle's** papers on free will and dispositions in *Philosopher's Imprint* and on properties in *Philosophy and* Phenomenological Research. Daly and Liggins began the AHRC funded The Foundations of Ontology project in 2012 (awarded £80,202) that will continue through to 2015. Major research outputs in the history of 20th century philosophy include **Stevens**' research monograph A Theory of Descriptions (Palgrave) and **Uebel**'s paper in *Erkenntnis*. In addition, **Uebel** has acted as Leader for Team E (History of Philosophy of Science) in collaboration with Stevens on a 5-year ESFfunded network Philosophy of Science in European Perspective (€ 800.000 administered via Bologna).



The strategy of the unit has also been responsive to changes in research interests, impactgenerating research and collaborations among members of staff:

- -- In response to a flourishing interest in the philosophy of language, the unit made this field an area of specialisation in place of epistemology. There have been a number of notable research outputs, including a research monograph by **Scott** *Religious Language* (Palgrave), papers by **Stevens** in *Philosophical Studies* and by **Daly** in *Philosophical Studies* and *Mind*.
- -- The area of aesthetics was expanded to include the emotions, due to the interconnections between these subjects resulting from work by Peter Goldie, whose edited volume *Oxford Handbook of the Emotions* appeared in 2012. Since Goldie's death, work has continued in this field with some major publications, including **Abell**'s paper in *Philosophical Review*, and a recent large AHRC grant (£198,065) for the *Knowledge of Emotion* project on which **Smith** is PI and **Abell** Co-I that runs from 2012 to 2015.
- -- A new departure in research in the unit since 2009, developing from existing areas of specialisation, has connected the fields of moral psychology (**Scott**), aesthetics and the emotions (Goldie), work in 20th Century Analytic Philosophy on economic models (**Uebel**) and issues to do with justice and sustainability (**O'Neill**). The unit has as a result made *moral motivation, justice and sustainability* one of its specialist themes. Subsequently, two significant research grants were secured in connection with this research theme: *The Motivations of Indifference* (Goldie, **Scott**) and the EC funded FP7 project *BIOMOT* (**O'Neill**, **Scott**) 2011-15 which is concerned with alternative ways to improve biodiversity policy making and governance and local, national and global scales. **O'Neill**'s influential and widely cited book *Environmental Values* (Routledge) is a notable research output. Research in this area of specialisation has been a key driver of impact.

c. People, including:

i. Staffing strategy and staff development

When making new academic appointments, the central aim has been to appoint philosophers of the highest international quality who work within or build upon the unit's existing areas of specialization. For example, Professor Helen **Beebee**, who was appointed to the Samuel Hall Chair in Philosophy in 2012, is a leading figure in metaphysics; Tim **Bayne**, appointed to professor in 2012, is a leading figure in the philosophy of mind. All new appointments in Philosophy must demonstrate the ability to publish in high-quality journals, and many have already gained a sufficiently high reputation to garner invitations from abroad. New staff are also mentored by experienced members of staff, a process that covers research, administration and the peer review of teaching. The development of a mentoring culture is supported through the award-winning Manchester Gold programme, which is available to any staff member at the University. Staff on this programme are matched to a more experienced colleague, who acts as their career mentor over a nine-month period (Beebee is a mentor). The Faculty of Humanities New Academics Programme plays an important role in ensuring that the University supports new academics in developing their career and, in doing so, also achieves its ambitious and wide-ranging goals. An academic career at the University of Manchester involves a broad range of tasks including: teaching, research, student support, knowledge transfer and academic management. The New Academics Programme is accredited by the Higher Education Academy (HEA) and is compulsory for all academic staff appointed to probationary permanent contracts. In the 2013 UoM staff survey (71% return rate), 94% of respondents said that the University is a good place to work, 92% feel proud to work at the University, and 91% agree that facilities for research are good. This places UoM highest of the 28 HEIs surveyed by Capita. Results were also very positive within the unit.

Once at Manchester, members of academic staff in Philosophy enter an environment that is thoroughly research-informed. Both staff and graduate students attend a weekly two-hour research seminar where leading philosophers are invited to present and engage in discussion about their current research. As part of our strategy of strengthening research, the unit's teaching (including undergraduate teaching) has become more strongly integrated with its research life. Undergraduate lectures and tutorials for third year courses are presented by top class philosophers working in their own areas of research or interest. First and second-year tutorials are largely



delivered by a team of trained graduate teaching assistants (GTAs) from our own PhD students. All GTAs undergo training at both School and unit level, and their performance is monitored by course convenors (that is, by full-time members of academic staff). The results of this change in policy have been excellent: PhD students build up valuable teaching experience, undergraduate students are integrated with newer researchers, and members of academic staff have more of their time freed up to concentrate, apart from their lectures, on small-group third-year and graduate teaching and on their own research.

Lecturers are not left isolated when conducting their research. In addition to the existence of organic, informal collaborative research networks, the unit manages fora that are designed both to support lecturers and to monitor their performance. All members of staff undergo a yearly Performance and Development Review, a documented process undertaken by the head of the unit in which lecturers discuss both their performance over the year and their research plans. This review facilitate staff to take full responsibility for the development of their own research profiles with the active support of the School, in accordance with the seven key principles of the Concordat to Support the Career Development of Researchers. More widely, the University has a Concordat Implementation Plan to ensure full support for the Concordat and has received the HR Excellence in Research Award from the European Commission in recognition of this work. Research Staff Handbooks have also been distributed, ensuring that all researchers are aware of all the support available to them.

The School has a generous sabbatical system linked to a regular assessment of research performance, where research-active lecturing staff usually receive one semester's research leave after six. Over the course of the REF period, members of staff received 17 semesters (8½ years) of sabbatical time. All full-time lecturers have a yearly individual research account of £1000 that can be spent on, amongst other things, attendance of conferences. Since 2008 the unit has also welcomed 5 postdoctoral researchers who have made substantial contributions to key areas of the unit's research themes within specific projects on the philosophy of mind, on consumption and sustainability and moral motivation (including significant outputs by Paul Knights and Michiru Nagatsu on the latter; Nagatsu also co-organised the *Green Nudges* conference, 2010, and Knights the large BIOMOT conference at Manchester in 2013). All of these elements combine to give the Philosophy unit a robust, collaborative and dynamic research culture that receives effective institutional support.

Since 2009, the Faculty of Humanities has had a target of achieving (by 2015) significant progress towards having a workforce which mirrors the social, ethnic, disability and gender make-up of its local community and wider society (specific targets for gender, ethnicity and disability to be developed in liaison with the HR, E&D and Disability teams). Of the two new permanent additions to the unit since 2008 as the Samuel Hall Professor, Beebee is the most senior position within the unit. Equality issues within UK philosophy are also part of **Beebee**'s research and have led to her recent publication, with Jenny Saul, of the influential 'Women in Philosophy in the UK' for the SWIP/BPA committee (discussed further in the impact statement). More widely, the University is committed to the advancement of equality in employment and career development for its staff. Equality data monitoring and action planning is therefore embedded into its annual performance reviews. This includes monitoring and identifying actions in relation to recruitment, current staff profile and promotion. Additionally, the University has a dedicated support service for disabled staff and has been awarded the "Two Ticks" disability symbol. This is a guaranteed interview scheme for disabled job applicants who meet the essential job criteria. The University is also one of a small group of institutions that is part of an Equality Challenge Unit's Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) Systemic Change Pilot and have implemented actions to develop specific career develop initiatives in relation to recruitment and mentoring.

ii. Research students

An important part of the unit's strategy is the development of a large and thriving body of PGR students. Some headway was made with this over the RAE period but significant further progress has been made since 2008. This is shown in both the increased numbers of PhD students and the successes with locating funding. In 2008 the unit successfully applied to the AHRC 'block grant



partnership' and secured seven studentships over five years: four at the PhD level and three for students taking the MRes programme. A funded PhD student is also currently attached to the AHRC *Knowledge and Emotion* research project. The unit additionally receives institutional support from the School of Social Sciences that has funded studentships for one or two PhD students in Philosophy every year since 2008. All funding applications go through a rigorous review process and are assessed by a gender balanced committee. The unit continues to receive self-funded students attracted to the research specialisms of the unit and to the research strengths of members of staff.

The Philosophy unit runs a Master of Research (MRes) degree, introduced in 2006, aimed at high-quality graduates expected to progress to PhD. The MRes prepares students for the PhD by writing a longer thesis than MA students and by working on tightly focused course units of direct relevance to the research interests of members of staff (e.g. two recently introduced MRes modules are **Bayne**'s course on consciousness and **Liggins**' course 'Grounding' on non-causal dependence). The MRes includes a research skills course unit, which develops the students' personal development planning, dissertation research design, and presentation skills.

PhD students benefit from regular individual supervisions, a weekly PhD seminar (in which they present their work to an audience comprising their peers and at least two members of academic staff), and a six-monthly supervisory board (in which their two supervisors and a third member of staff review their progress and provide academic support). The primary purpose of the PhD seminar is to provide a forum in which students present their research and thereby develop both their academic work and the presentational skills required for a career in academic philosophy. Elements of the students' personal development planning are embedded into the seminar structure with sessions discussing CV writing, journal publication, interview technique, etc. Alongside the compulsory PhD seminar, doctoral students are encouraged to attend any PGT courses that are appropriate given their research and are expected to attend the weekly research seminars. There are regular meetings between staff and graduate representatives to discuss any aspect of the student experience and learning environment.

PhD students participate in a wide range of scholarly (and social) activities. Since 2006 Philosophy has run an annual graduate conference called *Open Minds* that is organized by a committee of graduate students. Well-known speakers are invited (recent examples include Tim Williamson, Jonathan Dancy and Robin LePoidevin) and the conference has attracted participants from all over the UK and internationally. Philosophy also runs numerous academic conferences each year (described below) that invariably connect up with the research interests of a number of the graduate students; graduate participation in these conferences is encouraged (and they can freely attend). Funding is available to support PhD students presenting papers outside Manchester: as well as funds from the School of Social Sciences and the unit, the Peter Goldie Fund provides up to £1000 per year to philosophy students. In addition, there are usually at least five reading groups every year focused on books or thematically connected articles; these are open to graduate students, and those with relevant research interests invariably attend. These are also often attended by visiting research students; there were two visiting students in 2011-12, each attending for one semester, and two attending in 2012-13 for two semesters; a further two students visited for shorter periods.

Evidence of the strength of recent and current PhD students is provided by a number of recent successes in publishing in major peer review journals: Philip Brown had two papers accepted for publication in *Philosophical Studies* (one joint with **Scott**) before his graduation in 2011; Michael Clark, who graduated in 2012, has published one paper in *Erkenntnis* and one in *Analysis* (joint with **Liggins**); Hichem Naar, who graduated in 2013, has had a paper accepted for publication in *Pacific Philosophical Quarterly*. Leo Tarasov, in the first year of his PhD, has had a paper accepted for publication in *Philosophical Quarterly*. Ben Matheson has a paper forthcoming in *Philosophical Studies*. Six PhD students who completed since 2008 are postdoctoral research fellows; four have lectureship positions.

d. Income, infrastructure and facilities

Philosophy has secured a number of significant research grants over the REF period from a variety



of different sources, including research councils, industrial/commercial funding, European Commission and charities. This far outstrips the performance at RAE 2008 and reflects the research strengths within the unit. The projects include:

- 1. Emotions, Ethics and Moral Heuristics, 2008-10 (£49,167). An AHRC funded project, Goldie Pl.
- 2. *Motivations of Indifference*, 2009-10 (£95,460). Funded by the Sustainable Consumption Institute resourced by Tesco Stores Ltd. Goldie PI, **Scott** Co-I and postdoc, Dr. Michiru Nagatsu.
- 3. *Fictionalism and Expressive Power*, 2009-10 (£24,316). Funded by the AHRC research leave scheme, **Liggins** PI.
- 4. *Climate Change, Justice, Vulnerability* (£ 54,183). A project funded by the charity Joseph Rowntree Foundation analysing the impacts of climate change, **O'Neill** PI.
- 5. Climate Change, Justice and Insurance (£7,428). Joseph Rowntree funded project, O'Neill Pl.
- 6. Substance Causation and Agent Causation, 2011-12 (£20,443). AHRC funded, Whittle Pl.
- 7. BIOMOT, 2011-15 (total over 4m Euro; Manchester component approx. €490,000). An EC FP7 project with 7 partner universities, **O'Neill** and **Scott** PIs and postdoc Dr. Paul Knights.
- 8. Knowledge of Emotion: Expression and social cognition, 2012-15 (£189,065). An AHRC funded project, **Smith** PI and **Abell** Co-I.
- 9. The Foundations of Ontology, 2012-15 (£80,202). ARHC funded with Liggins PI, Daly Co-I.
- 10. The Architecture of Consciousness, 2013-17 (1.5m Euro). A five year ERC grant, Bayne PI.
- 11. Consciousness and free will, 2011-13 (310,040USD). Funded by the Templeton Foundation "Big Questions in Free Will" Initiative. **Bayne** PI with Hakwan Lau, a psychologist at Colombia University.
- 12. *Climate Just*, 2013-2014 (£89,845). Funded by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation and the Environment Agency, **O'Neill** Co-I.
- 13. Climate Change, Justice and Vulnerability in Scotland, 2012-2013 (£1,928). Funded by the Scottish Environment Protection Agency, **O'Neill** Co-I.
- 14. *Conflict over Commons*, 2012-14 (£21,200). British Council funded a joint project with Bogazici University (Istanbul, Turkey), **O'Neill** PI.

Projects 2, 4, 5 and 6 have also yielded substantial impacts and are discussed further in the impact statement and case studies. Many of the projects are collaborative between members of the unit and have built on or enhanced connections between the main strategic research areas. Additionally, a number are collaborative with scholars with shared interests in other units in the University or closely associated bodies, notably (7) with economics, (4, 12, 13) with Geography and the Tyndall Centre of Climate Change Research, (11) with Linguistics.

The School Research Office provides excellent help in grant applications and conference organization. Support from this office has been instrumental in constructing budgets for the projects above. Within the unit, there is a group of three senior staff who review draft research applications before they are submitted. The review group discusses the project with applicants, providing feedback to help improve the proposal's structure and content; this process has assisted the significant recent successes in securing grants.

Graduate students benefit from the research space and facilities provided by the £30 million Arthur Lewis Building opened in summer 2007 which enables all academic staff and research students in Philosophy to be co-located in well-equipped surroundings and in close proximity to colleagues from other social sciences. All staff and research students have full technical support in relation to computing, internet access, remote access to university networks and resources, and other research resources. PhD students are housed in spacious purpose-designed open plan research areas surrounded by the offices of academic staff. This provides the optimal arrangement for informal discussion between academics and graduate students.

The University of Manchester Library, as a designated National Research Library, offers a range of



tailored products and services to directly underpin research at Manchester including over 30,000 philosophy books. The library provides facilities across campus with a range of IT facilities, providing access to an unparalleled range of electronic resources including over 40,000 e-journals and a complete range of research databases; the Library is highly responsive in expanding resources to the research needs of the unit. Through Manchester e-scholar it offers researchers a premium resource to both deposit and disseminate their research outputs. The Library also delivers a range of bespoke training services to researchers in all areas of the research process and launched a Research Data Management policy and service in 2013.

e. Collaboration or contribution to the discipline or research base

Residency/visiting positions:

Uebel: Visiting Professor, Institute of Philosophy, University of Vienna, 2011-12 (spring semester); **MacDonald**: Adjunct Professor of Philosophy, University of Canterbury, Christchurch, New Zealand, September 2006-August 2012.

Editorial positions:

Beebee is editor of *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*. Associate editors: *Australasian Journal of Philosophy* (**Dodd**, **Daly**, **Liggins**), *Mind and Language* (**Bayne**), *British Journal for the Philosophy of Science* (**Beebee**), *Philosophical Investigations* (**Scott**) *New Political Economy* (**O'Neill**), *The Monist*, special issue on music (**Dodd**), *Theoria* (**Beebee**). **Scott** is co-editor of *Ars Disutandi*.

Consultant editors of books or book series: Springer (**Uebel**), Palgrave Macmillan (**Scott**, **Uebel**), UCL Press (**MacDonald**).

Members of staff on editorial boards: Analysis (Daly), Environmental Values (O'Neill), Facta Philosophica (Daly), Grazer Philosophische Studien (Uebel), International Journal of Philosophical Studies (Macdonald), Journal of Applied Philosophy (O'Neill), Philosophical Investigations (Scott), EJPS (Beebee), Australasian Journal of Philosophy (Beebee, Macdonald), HOPOS. Journal for the History of Philosophy of Science (Uebel), Hume Studies (Beebee), Philosophical Explorations (Macdonald).

Members of the unit have been external grant reviewers for the Academy of Finland (**Beebee**), the Nuffield Council on Bioethics: New Approaches to Biofuels (**O'Neill**), the Israel Science Foundation (**Scott**) and Institute of Philosophy (**Smith**). Since 2008, staff members have been external examiners for 7 undergraduate or postgraduate programmes, 9 PhDs and 4 MPhils.

Numerous conferences/workshops have been organised in the unit since 2008, including: The Philosophy of Mathematics conference, May 2008 (Daly, Liggins); Philosophy of Language Workshop 2009, funded by the Mind Association minor conference grant (**Dodd**): The Just Price June 2009. (O'Neill); Justice and Climate Change: Normative and Conceptual Issues, March 2010 (O'Neill); Hallsworth Conference on Financialisation and Environmental Governance, April 2010, funded £6,030.00, (O'Neill); Workshop on Adam Smith's 'The Theory of Moral Sentiments', May 2010 (O'Neill); Fictionalism conference, May 2009 (Daly, Liggins); Green Nudges conference, June 2010 (Scott); Integrating Climate Justice and Policy Practice September 2010 (O'Neill); The Revival of Political Economy Coimbra, Portugal, October 2010 (O'Neill was a member of the organising committee); Celebrating the Work of Peter Goldie 2012, funded by the Mind Association major conference grant (Dodd); Collective Intentionality VIII, four day conference August 2012; The foundations of ontology workshop, September 2012 (Daly, Liggins); BIOMOT conference on biodiversity, February 2013; Emotion and Expression conference, June 2013 (Smith); Cognitive Ontology, a cross-disciplinary workshop on the implications of neuroimaging work for the philosophy of mind, June 2013 (Bayne); Free Will and Moral Responsibility workshop, July 2013 (Beebee); Philosophy in the North West, July 2013 (Smith); The Foundations of Ontology workshop, funded by the Foundations of Ontology AHRC project, September 2013 (Daly, Liggins); Social Cognition Workshop, September 2013 (Smith); Mind Network Meeting, September 2013 (Bayne).

Membership of Research Council or similar national and international committees:



REF philosophy panel member (**MacDonald**); AHRC Peer Review College (**Beebee**, **Dodd**, **MacDonald**); AHRC Advisory Board (**Beebee**); the ESRC Climate Change Fellowship Commissioning Panel (**O'Neill**); BPA/SWiP Women in Philosophy committee (**Beebee**); International Advisory Board for NWO, Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research, Programme on Responsible Innovation (**O'Neill**).

Research strategy/review boards membership:

Vienna Science and Technology Fund evaluator (**MacDonald**); Vienna Research Groups for Young Investigators: jury member (**MacDonald**); *GeNECA Just Sustainable Development Based on the Capability Approach*, Leipzig 2010-2012: International advisory board (**O'Neill**); *Environmental Justice Organisations, Liability and Trade* (EJOLT) 2011-2014 EC FP7 project: Moral Philosophy Advisor (**O'Neill**); Research Council of Canada, Social Sciences and Humanities: Research assessor (**Daly**); International Society for the History of Philosophy of Science: committee member (**Uebel**); European Network for the Philosophy of the Social Sciences: Steering Committee (**Uebel**); Vienna Circle Institute: Advisory Board (**Uebel**).

Professional Subject associations and learned societies:

In addition to memberships of well-known professional organisations such as The Aristotelian Society and the BPA, **Dodd** is on the executive committee of the Mind Association and treasurer of the Music and Philosophy Study Group and **Beebee** is on the Royal Institute of Philosophy council and executive committee.

Refereeing for leading academic publishers: Acumen (MacDonald, Uebel), Ashgate (Scott) Cambridge UP (Daly, MacDonald, Scott, Uebel), Edinburgh UP (MacDonald), MIT Press (Smith), Oxford UP (Daly, MacDonald, Smith, Uebel), Palgrave Macmillan (Beebee, O'Neill, Scott, Uebel), Routledge (Beebee, Daly, MacDonald, Scott, Smith, Uebel), Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Uebel), Wiley Blackwell (MacDonald, Scott, Whittle).

Invited Keynotes/Lectures:

Staff have given leading addresses at numerous institutions, including: The Royal Institute of Philosophy (workshop on self-knowledge) (**MacDonald**), The Aristotelian Society (virtual conference on Truth) (**Dodd**), the Max Plank Institute (**Uebel**) and at the following universities: Athens, Barcelona, Birkbeck, Bogazici Istanbul, Birmingham, Budapest, Cambridge, Duke, Glasgow, Gothenburg, Helsinki, Houston, Humbolt Berlin, King's College London, McMaster, Munich, Oslo, Oxford, Paris Ecole Normale Superieur, Seoul, Texas, Tilburg, Turku Finland, Vienna, Zurich.

Collaboration with other organisations:

Team leader in the European Science Foundation Research Networking Programme (**Uebel**) Royal Institute of Philosophy (**Liggins** organiser of the Manchester branch).

Collaborations:

Issues in Semantics at the Intersection of Linguistics and Philosophy (**Stevens**) joint with Linguistics at Manchester. Funded by the University of Manchester Research Institute (£10,000) Funded collaborative projects with other departments and institutions are listed under (d).