Institution: University of Stirling

Unit of Assessment: D32 Philosophy

a. Overview

Institutional setting

Philosophy at Stirling is one of two disciplines forming the Division of Law and Philosophy, itself one of four multi-disciplinary divisions constituting the School of Arts and Humanities, formed following academic restructuring in 2011. The submission also includes one political philosopher (BAUMEISTER) based in the Division of History and Politics.

Thematic organization

Our research is organized into the following clusters, which reflect members' individual research strengths as well as areas of shared interest.

- *Legal, Moral and Political Philosophy*: Andrea BAUMEISTER, Rowan CRUFT, Antony DUFF, Simon HOPE

- *Mind and Knowledge*: Steinvor ARNADOTTIR, Zoe DRAYSON, Adrian HADDOCK, Alan MILLAR, Michael WHEELER

- *Philosophy of Logic and Language, including History of Analytic Philosophy*: Colin JOHNSTON, Peter MILNE, Walter PEDRIALI, Sonia ROCA-ROYES, Peter SULLIVAN, Robert TRUEMAN

These clusters are not formalized organizational units, but are effective strategic groupings that inform and direct our research activity. They guide appointments, stimulate internal collaborations, and are foci for the design and management of external collaborations and funded research projects.

While each member of staff is primarily attached to one of these three clusters, many have interests that make connections between them. For example, MIILAR's comparison of practical and theoretical reasons bridges the first two, while ROCA-ROYES' investigations in the epistemology of modality connect the second and third; similarly, HADDOCK approaches issues about objectivity and forms of idealism in ways that connect closely with SULLIVAN's historical research.

Administrative organization

BAUMEISTER, MILNE and WHEELER are members of the School Executive. As School Research Director WHEELER chairs the School Research Committee, with oversight of research policies and initiatives. As Head of Philosophy MILNE has primary responsibility for translating policies into practice at subject level, while SULLIVAN as Research Director advises members of the department on their individual research plans. Research policy and projects form a standing agenda item for the sub-Divisional meeting of the Philosophy subject group each semester.

b. Research strategy

As anticipated in RAE 2008, our thematic organization into the three research clusters outlined above has been a constant feature of our research profile over the assessment period. It provides stability and coherence to our research efforts. We intend to continue it, and have no plans for a major shift of research direction. The decision to emphasize these three broad areas of research of course implies that some other valuable fields – particularly, for instance, earlier periods of the history of philosophy – are de-emphasized. We believe that this is an appropriate stance for a unit of our size, and that the acknowledged costs are more than outweighed by the possibilities for collaboration that our arrangements bring.

We think of the clusters as means of concentrating and exploiting the energy of individuals' research ambitions, not as externally imposed directives. So it is natural that the balance between clusters, and shifts of emphasis within them, should reflect staffing changes.

Of 15 submitted staff (12.4 fte), 9 were included in Stirling's submissions to RAE 2008. This

reflects a genuine stability: no permanent member of staff has seen reason to move on (other than through retirement). But it might also obscure the fact that the assessment period has been one of significant transition. The years 2008-10 saw the retirement of three senior and long-serving professors. DUFF and MILLAR have continued as members of the department, holding fractional contracts (0.2 FTE) since their formal retirement. These arrangements were designed to promote continuity of ethos and intellectual approach, and to give time for others to grow into leadership roles. Both continue to supervise postgraduate researchers and have an important role in mentoring other staff.

The six members of staff submitted for the first time were all appointed as early career researchers and are spread across our three clusters. In Legal, Moral and Political philosophy our priority, in the face of DUFF's retirement, has been to maintain a research engagement with areas of concrete practice. The appointment of HOPE contributes to this aim, while shifting the emphasis of the cluster towards practical problems of political rather than legal philosophy. In Mind and Knowledge the appointment of ARNADOTTIR has consolidated the cluster's central concern with the metaphysics of mind, following MILLAR's retirement, while DRAYSON (Research Fellow) helps to link the traditional analytic and the more scientifically informed approaches that exist within it. In Logic and Language, JOHNSTON reinforces an existing strength in history of analytic philosophy, while PEDRIALI (Leverhulme Fellow), and TRUEMAN (Research Fellow) connect this historical work to contemporary issues in philosophy of language. These developments are consonant with the plan outlined in RAE 2008 and address the strategic challenges noted then.

The conclusion of this transitional period sees us well placed to further strengthen our research in the next assessment period. HADDOCK and JOHNSTON have recently won promotion to Senior Lecturer; CRUFT has assumed leadership of the Legal, Moral and Political cluster. All have established themselves in securing substantial AHRC awards, and join Professors MILNE, SULLIVAN, and WHEELER in leading collaborative work.

It is characteristic of philosophy not to be confined by institutional boundaries, and much of our work is naturally interdisciplinary. DUFF's projects in jurisprudence involve and address lawyers and philosophers jointly. CRUFT's work on rights, and HOPE's work on the forms and cultural reach of democracy, are continuous with BAUMEISTER's investigations of political legitimacy. WHEELER's concern with the material, social and technological realizations of extended cognitive systems is pursued in projects alongside researchers in archaeology, comparative literature, fine art and psychology; while in the more technical aspects of formal epistemology MILNE works alongside mathematicians and computer scientists. Although many of our interdisciplinary collaborations have also been across different institutions, BAUMEISTER's inclusion in the political philosophy cluster illustrates how the closer relations between disciplines in the School of Arts and Humanities provides a new context for them.

It is essential to the coherence of our research efforts that every member of staff should be informed of and responsive to developments in the external research environment, and involved in setting our research priorities. The full staff therefore sits as a Research Committee for part of each sub-Divisional Philosophy meeting. A smaller Research Group, comprising MILNE (Head of Philosophy), ROCA-ROYES (Research Officer), and SULLIVAN (Director of Research) has responsibility for encouraging and advising others in the construction of research projects and funding applications. ROCA-ROYES liaises with the Research Office to keep members of staff informed of university policies affecting research as well as research council and other external developments and opportunities; part of her role is to explore new sources of research funding.

c. People, including:

i.   Staffing strategy and staff development

Our arrangements are designed to ensure that every member of staff is thoroughly integrated into a collegial body that conceives research as its central rationale. Much of what sustains this is informal: it has to do at least as much with the attitudes of staff to one another – their availability to discuss issues with colleagues, their readiness to read work in draft and offer constructive criticism – as with any formal policies. These attitudes are however reflected in more formal staffing policies.

Researcher development

Concordat. The University was one of the first signatories in the UK of the Concordat to Support the Career Development of Researchers in 2009, with its implementation earning Stirling the EU HR Excellence in Research Award in 2011 and renewal of the Award in 2013.

Achieving Success. Philosophy's implementation of the University appraisal framework, *Achieving Success*, gives priority to the setting and monitoring of goals for research development. All non-probationary staff are involved in the scheme, and meet annually to discuss with the Head of Philosophy and Research Director the progress of their individual research plans, possibilities for internal and external collaboration, and the development of funding applications. A key element of the discussion is to identify ways in which the Division can help individuals to realize research goals, e.g. through the adjustment of teaching loads, workshop support or other 'pump-priming' funds.

Mentoring. The Research Director regularly discusses with colleagues appropriate goals and formats for research projects at the earliest stages, long before they take formal shape in funding applications, and will involve senior colleagues in the area of the project to share in this mentoring role.

Peer review. Project applications submitted from Philosophy are conceived as collective endeavours, and are invariably revised after comments from at least two senior colleagues engaged in the area and experienced in relevant funding regimes. Following a model set in Philosophy, the School has established a panel of outstanding senior researchers, including DUFF, to offer strategic advice and a final level of peer review.

Support for Early Career Researchers

Probation. New lecturers appointed to Philosophy, both permanent and fixed term, benefit from the supportive and protective provisions of the University probation scheme. They have a reduced teaching load (60%) and are assigned no major administrative roles.

Senior colleague. Early career researchers are assigned a Senior Colleague in the field of their research, who advises on the development of research plans required by the University's probationary scheme. Senior colleagues work closely with probationers, reading drafts, suggesting promising directions, advising them on suitable outlets for presentation and publication of their work.

Cluster attachment. Each of our research clusters benefits from the leadership of established senior researchers. The clusters thus serve an important role in developing the careers of younger researchers, involving them in collaborative projects and discussions of future research directions.

Project involvement. Early career researchers are inducted into collaborative project work through the leadership of senior researchers. For instance, HADDOCK was first a co-investigator in an AHRC project led by MILLAR, and has since held two AHRC awards as Principal Investigator; CRUFT initially contributed papers to AHRC projects led by DUFF, and has in turn involved HOPE as a contributor to his own independent AHRC projects.

Temporary staff. Project funding gained by established staff has meant that we have typically had one lecturer on a temporary contract. We regard temporary members of staff as young researchers setting out in the profession and treat them accordingly (for instance, we have not used teaching-only contracts). Temporary members of staff benefit from the same protective and supportive provisions as apply to new permanent lecturers. DRAYSON recently advanced from a temporary lectureship to hold a Research Fellowship with us, while our three previous temporary lecturers (JOHNSTON, Jonathan Way, Simon Robertson) have all moved on to permanent positions. Similarly, Massimo Renzo (RA on DUFF's *Criminalization* project, and now Senior Lecturer at Warwick) was supported in the development of his own research projects and was enabled to move directly to a permanent lectureship.

General staffing policies

Equality and diversity. The University has a strategic commitment to valuing and promoting equality and diversity in research careers and this work is championed by an established network of equality contacts. Flexible working is available to those with caring responsibilities, there are clear policies on consideration of career breaks and part time working in terms of advancement

and promotion, and there are strengthened guidelines for appointing committees to address equality issues. The University signed the Athena SWAN national charter for women in science in 2011 and gained the bronze level institutional award in 2013. We are now actively pursuing the Athena SWAN silver award and the principles and practices behind Athena SWAN are utilised across all academic areas.

Research leave. Members of staff are entitled to apply for research leave each seventh semester. We have arranged for all staff, and particularly Early Career Researchers, to take leave as soon as they are eligible, and have treated time spent on a temporary contract (JOHNSTON) or a Fellowship (ROCA-ROYES) as contributing to leave entitlement. We encourage staff to coordinate plans for institutional leave with external research applications; three recent such applications yielded AHRC Fellowship awards. The University formally monitors research leave performance; mentoring discussions at subject level more closely review the scheme's effectiveness.

Unpaid leave. We have shown flexibility in arranging periods of unpaid leave for research development. For instance, ARNADOTTIR's assumption of lectureship duties was postponed for two years to allow her to complete a Leverhulme Early Career Fellowship at Cambridge.

Career progression. The prospects for career progression, and steps that might be taken to improve them, are a topic for every annual appraisal discussion, as well as of informal mentoring discussions. Where appropriate, the subject head works closely with colleagues in constructing the strongest possible case for advancement.

Research budget. Each member of staff has the use of a basic annual research budget for conference attendance, etc. Further discretionary funds (e.g. for major conference presentations, specialist software or cd-rom texts) are allocated on application to the Head of Division and with advice from the Philosophy research group.

Support for postdoctoral researchers

Research Fellowships. We have been active in seeking external funding for post-doctoral researchers, and have had substantial Fellowship support from the School and the University. From 2007-12 ROCA-ROYES held an RCUK Fellowship (through an award to SULLIVAN). With assistance from the School we have each year sponsored applications for Leverhulme Early Career Fellowships: PEDRIALI joined us as Leverhulme Fellow in 2012. The University's Impact Fellowship scheme supported the appointments of DRAYSON and TRUEMAN in 2013. We have also sought funding for shorter post-doctoral visiting positions: e.g. Max Cappuccio's six-month attachment as Research Fellow was sponsored by a Royal Society of Edinburgh-Caledonian Research Foundation award to MILLAR and WHEELER (2009).

Transition of RPGs into the profession. By marshalling resources, by offering assistantship roles in both the administrative and the intellectual work of funded projects, and by allocating fractional lecturing contracts to cover for leave we have aimed to assist our own graduating doctoral students into the profession. During 2010-12 Daniele Mezzadri (UAEU), Ambrose Lee (Oxford) and Piero Moraro (Charles Stuart University) were helped in this way towards their first positions.

ii. Research students
The SASP programme

The most significant development in Research Postgraduate (RPG) provision during the assessment period has been the extension of our partnership with St Andrews in the St Andrews and Stirling Philosophy (SASP) programme, which since 2008-9 has been fully integrated to PhD level: RPGs are now admitted jointly, are registered at both universities throughout their study, and receive degrees awarded on behalf of both universities. The programme is managed by a committee drawn equally from St Andrews and Stirling. Supervisors are allocated according to expertise and without regard to affiliation; funding is likewise available to all students. By providing access to the combined resources of the two universities this partnership greatly increases the range of expert supervision available to RPGs, and enriches their educational experience. The informal 'Leiter'-rankings consistently place our programme in the top three in the UK.

Recruitment

The recruiting potential of the combined SASP programme has been one factor in enabling significant growth at RPG level. In 2013 Stirling philosophers were first supervisor to 24 RPGs (20

PhD, 4 MPhil) and second supervisor to 22 (19 PhD, 3 MPhil), contrasting with a typical number of 5-7 RPGs before the programme was established. Similarly important has been our increased commitment to teaching and supervision at masters level: over the assessment period, average MLitt numbers have more than doubled (from approx. 18 to approx. 40), while Stirling's proportional contribution to the degree has increased from 1/3 to 1/2. PhD applications to SASP have exceeded 75 in each of the past three years; actual recruitment is limited primarily by funding.

Studentship funding

Of Stirling-supervised RPGs six are AHRC-funded. University support for internally funded awards, from which eight others benefit, remains crucial to recruitment: three hold University-funded International Scholarships, while five hold bursaries funded by the School of Arts and Humanities. Through the SASP collaboration, several other Stirling-supervised students hold internal awards funded by the University of St Andrews.

Monitoring and support of PGRS

In addition to first and second supervisors, each student has a review committee; annual reviews are conducted in accordance with the procedures of St Andrews. Each RPG has an annual travel budget for attendance at conferences, and with support from the Scots Philosophical Association the programme provides funds for graduate-organized conferences (e.g., the extremely successful series of Stirling conferences on Legal Philosophy).

Skills training

RPGs have access to the seminars and training sessions provided through the Stirling Graduate Research School, and to the parallel Gradskills programme at St Andrews. In annual reviews participation in these programmes is monitored and training needs identified.

Integration of RPGs in the research environment

While SASP students are members of two universities, most will primarily base themselves in one. Stirling-based RPGs are provided with designated office space and workstation, with access to a full range of research resources. Working next to us in the building, they are on-hand for informal meetings with staff. Overseen by the SASP Deputy Director, a weekly student-organized work-in-progress seminar gives them experience of presenting their research. RPGs are strongly encouraged to attend our weekly staff work-in-progress seminars and visiting-speaker seminars. Student testimonials and our strong placement record (SASP was ranked top in the UK, and 3rd worldwide, in the 2012 report published by prophilosophy.wordpress.com) testify equally to the extent to which RPGs are made to feel fully members of the philosophical community.

d. Income, infrastructure and facilities

Organizational infrastructure

Features of our organization at subject level that contribute to income generation were outlined in Section b: the collective sense of purpose engendered by involving all staff in setting research aims, and the spread of leadership responsibilities across senior staff encouraged by our organization into three clusters, contribute to a collegial ethos in which good ideas are nurtured into viable project applications. Weekly staff work-in-progress seminars play a similar role. They are opportunities to try out ideas in a constructive setting; very often they are followed up in informal discussions with the Research Director and other senior staff, and so feed into the mentoring process. This in turn informs the allocation of resources at subject level which, together with a grant from the university's Research Development Fund, have supported workshops exploring themes of possible collaborative projects. (Examples are workshops with the Logos group at the University of Barcelona, and workshops on formal epistemology co-organized with Martin Smith, Glasgow.)

Later stages of project design benefit from the expertise in funding schemes developed by Philosophy's Research Officer (ROCA-ROYES). The School's designated Research Development Manager in the University Research Office is based in the School each week, so is readily available to offer further advice on the formal details of various funding schemes. Other important contributions at School level include its recently formed expert panel, providing a final level of internal peer review, and the School's ability to budget for match-funding of Fellowship applications

(PEDRIALI's Leverhulme Early Career Fellowship is supported in this way).

Research income

Grant-funded projects. The first year of the assessment period saw the conclusion of one major AHRC Research Grant project,

- *The Value of Knowledge* (2005-8, £67k), MILLAR (PI), with HADDOCK and Duncan Pritchard (Edinburgh),

which led to a co-authored book and two collections published with OUP. 2008 also saw the start of another,

- *Criminalization* (2008-2012, £627k), DUFF (PI), with Sandra Marshall (Stirling), Lindsay Farmer (Law, Glasgow) and Victor Tadros (Law, Warwick),

which led to three edited collections with OUP. As well as a series of 6 UK workshops and a major conference in Stirling, this project also coordinated 5 workshops in Europe and Canada. Other substantially funded projects have been:

- *Institutionalizing Values: Beyond Human Rights* (AHRC Network, 2009-11, £49k), CRUFT (PI).
- *Rights and the Direction of Duties* (AHRC Early Career Research Grant, 2010-12, £74k), CRUFT (PI), with Leif Wenar (KCL).

Fellowships. AHRC Research Leave and Fellowship awards have been held by:

- HADDOCK (2008): Self-Knowledge of Action, and (2012), for a project investigating forms of idealism;
- JOHNSON (2012), for a project in the history of analytic philosophy.

Prior to assuming her lectureship ROCA-ROYES held an RCUK Fellowship for a project in the epistemology of modality (2007-12), and in 2012 PEDRIALI joined us as Leverhulme Early Career Fellow, conducting a project in the theory of meaning grounded in a striking reading of Frege's work.

Conference funding and other support. Members of staff have gained funding for conferences and workshops from: The Scots Philosophical Association; the Mind Association; The Aristotelian Society; the Analysis Trust; the Carnegie Trust; the Institute of Philosophy; the Royal Society of Edinburgh; the British Academy. Their participation in research networks has been supported by a range of national and international bodies, including the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft, Berlin's Wissenschaftskolleg and the USA's National Humanities Center.

Operational infrastructure

Staff in the University Research Office have been unfailingly prompt and constructive in helping us to negotiate the specific requirements of various funding regimes. The university's recently introduced Research Management System should further simplify the application process, lessening bureaucratic disincentives. STORRE, the university's online research repository, to which staff submit all published work, primarily assists the dissemination of research, but by increasing our visibility it also promotes further collaborations. Our projects have not required advanced technical support; nonetheless, Information Services make IT support readily available, and online subscriptions are a particular strength of the library provision supporting research.

e. Collaboration and contribution to the discipline or research base

Collaborations, partnerships and networks

In additional to projects based at Stirling, members of staff are named collaborators in research projects or networks funded by:

AHRC, for 'Cognitive Futures in the Humanities' (WHEELER);
ESF Eurocores, for 'Consciousness in Interaction' (WHEELER);
ESRC, for 'The Politics of Recognition and the Dynamics of Social Conflict' (BAUMEISTER)
German Research Council (DF), for a project in philosophy of action (HADDOCK);
RSE, for 'Engendering Dialogue' a project on feminist thought (WHEELER);
Spanish Government, for 'Translation and Context' (ROCA-ROYES);
USA National Humanities Center, for 'The Second Person' (HADDOCK).

More locally, several colleagues are Associate Fellows or project contributors to the Northern

Institute of Philosophy at Aberdeen (ROCA-ROYES, MILLAR), or participants in other cross-institution research groups, such as the Metaphysics Reading Group based in Glasgow (ARNADOTTIR, ROCA-ROYES). The Stirling Early Analytic Group brings specialists from across Scotland to its twice-yearly workshops. Combining disciplines within Stirling, the Political Philosophy Group, of which all staff in the Legal, Moral and Political cluster are core members, has an active seminar programme.

Advisory roles

Research Councils. CRUFT, DUFF and SULLIVAN have been members of the AHRC Peer Review College. WHEELER is a member of the Pool of Reviewers for the European Science Foundation. MILNE is an assessor for REF 2014. In addition to the major British funding bodies (AHRC, Leverhulme, Royal Society, RSE) colleagues have assessed research projects for the national research councils of Canada, Israel, Flanders, Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, USA (National Science Foundation), and for the European Commission Framework 7. Projects have been reviewed for the Center for Advanced Studies at Stanford, the University of Leuven, the Velux Foundation, and the Volkswagen Stiftung.

Learned societies and universities. DUFF is Fellow of the British Academy and is chairing a British Academy project on *Crime, Punishment and the Prison*. DUFF, MILLAR and SULLIVAN are Fellows of and active in the Royal Society of Edinburgh, serving on Sectional Committees dealing with Fellowship selection, and on a Committee for RSE-Caledonian Research Foundation awards. DUFF was President of the Mind Association in 2010-11, and MILLAR will be its Vice-President in 2013-14 and President in 2014-15. BAUMEISTER is Vice-Chair to the International Political Science Association (IPSA) Research Committee on Political Philosophy. WHEELER has been an adviser to the University of Edinburgh on research strategies and policies in philosophy.

Editorial and refereeing

DUFF is founding co-editor of *Criminal Law and Philosophy*, and WHEELER is Associate Editor of *BJPS.* Colleagues are members of editorial boards of seven other journals. All members of staff regularly contribute to the refereeing work of journals and academic presses. Collectively, they have reviewed manuscripts for the major philosophy publishers (e.g. CUP, OUP, Routledge, Harvard UP) and have refereed papers for over 70 journals, including all of the most notable UK and US journals.

Other contributions

Examining. Members of staff have examined more than 30 doctoral theses, and seven MPhil theses, in the UK, Europe and Australia.

Conferences and workshops. Stirling has hosted the major annual conferences of the Aristotelian Society and Mind Association (2012), the British Society for Ethical Theory (2012), the British Society for Philosophy of Science (2012) and the Association for Legal and Social Philosophy (2013). In addition to many other events in Stirling, colleagues have organized or co-organized conferences and workshops elsewhere in the UK (e.g Aberdeen, Edinburgh, London), in Europe (e.g. Barcelona, Copenhagen, Frankfurt, Helsinki, Lisbon, Oslo, Uppsala), North America (e.g. Kingston Ontario, Princeton, Rutgers), and at Jerusalem.

Presentations. Highlights of an unsummarizable catalogue of presentations by members of staff include: prestigious invited lectures, such as the John Dewey Lecture, Minneapolis 2009, the Simone Weil Lectures, Sydney and Melbourne 2010, and the Law and Ethics Annual Lecture at Rutgers, 2012 (DUFF); presentations by WHEELER to conferences devoted wholly to his work at the Free University, Amsterdam (2008) and the Goethe University, Frankfurt (2010), and his participation in a Sorbonne-sponsored seminar on Philosophy of the Web at the Pompidou Centre, 2012; series of invited papers to specialist international conferences at Bled, Slovenia, 2009, Bologna, 2010, and Geneva, 2012 (MILLAR), or Basel, 2009, Oslo, 2010, Munich, 2010, Leipzig, 2012 (HADDOCK). More important, though, to the current and future health of Philosophy at Stirling is that every member of staff is active in disseminating his or her research in appropriate contexts, ranging from invited lecture series, through national general conferences and smaller specialist workshops, to departmental seminars.