

| |
|--|
| Institution: Institute of Education |
| Unit of Assessment: 25 |
| Title of case study: Music in schools: Boosting achievement, enthusiasm and participation |
| 1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words) |

Findings from the IOE's substantial body of music research have had a significant impact on policy for successive Governments and NGOs in the UK and overseas, as well as on teaching and learning in the music classroom and outside. Research has led to curriculum innovation, increased participation and investment in music for all ages, including those with special needs, benefiting millions of children and young people attending schools in England and around the world. The impact derives from a wide range of externally funded studies, embracing music learning across all education sectors.

| |
|--|
| 2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words) |
|--|

Context: The IOE has the largest group of music education researchers in the UK and Europe. Their research embraces musical behaviour and development, learning and teaching throughout life, with 53 projects worth a total of £3m to the IOE since 2005. External funders include research councils (ESRC, EPSRC, AHRC), Europe (European Social Fund, EC Framework 7), major charities (Esmée Fairbairn, Paul Hamlyn, Youth Music, RNIB, Amber Trust), Central Government (DCSF), Local Authorities (Newham, Liverpool, Greater London Authority) and other organisations (for example, European Concert Hall Organisation, London Symphony Orchestra, Opera North, The Sage Gateshead). Foci include singing and musical instrument learning across the lifespan and the wider benefits of music, the development of innovative pedagogies, technology in music education, professional development of musicians, music teacher education and music in special education. This case study examines the impact of IOE research on music in schools. The research studies highlighted here document not only the effects of excellent teaching on children's musical skills, but the impact that a child's active engagement in music can have on: their perceptual, language and literacy skills; numeracy; intellectual development; general attainment and creativity; personal and social development; and physical development, health and wellbeing (see **R1**). Within this diverse research activity, major projects include:

Primary schools: Evaluation of 'Sing Up' (Professor Graham Welch (PI), Jo Saunders and Evangelos Himonides, 2007-12)

Key findings: The IOE team created the largest database on children's singing globally and found that children who took part in the Government's £44m, 5-year singing programme were, on average, two years ahead in their singing development (see research reference **R3**). Furthermore, better singers tended to have a more positive view of themselves and a stronger sense of social inclusion – a finding supported by related IOE research for the Italian government. **How the research was conducted:** The IOE team was consulted in the initial design of the national programme and, after a baseline audit of singing in 81 randomly selected schools, subsequently expanded their multi-methods data collection to 11,000+ children and 1,000+ teachers from 184 English schools to measure the programme's impact.

Secondary Schools: 'Musical Futures' (Professor Lucy Green, 2002-07) Following a pilot study in London, Green collaborated with Hertfordshire County Council on a national project to develop and evaluate radical new teaching and learning strategies for 11-14-year-olds drawn from the informal learning practices of popular musicians. This research brought a new method of teaching into the classroom based on five key principles of informal music learning (e.g. **R2**) and built bridges between the aims of institutional music education and the experience of many young people. **How the research was conducted:** Green developed a new pedagogy based on popular musicians' informal learning practices; teachers were then inducted into the pedagogy, and implemented and evaluated it in their schools. Data were collected through participant observation, audio recordings, teacher and student interviews, teacher meetings and anonymous questionnaires.

Impact case study (REF3b)

Special Schools: 'Sounds of Intent' (Welch and Himonides, with Adam Ockelford, Visiting Research Fellow at the IOE and Professor of Music at Roehampton, 2002-ongoing) The project was set up in collaboration with the RNIB to help overcome the immense variability of music teaching for children in special schools. Initially, having worked closely with 10 schools to map the musical development of children with learning difficulties, this dataset was used by Himonides to design an interactive online resource to support music learning in special schools nationally (**R4**). How the research was conducted: Researchers made thousands of observations from hundreds of children to develop a model of musical engagement. Pedagogic materials (including video) were trialled from case studies of more than 20 schools.

Wider benefits of music in schools: A literature review commissioned by DfES from Professor Susan Hallam for the Year of Music highlighted music's powerful contribution to children's education and wider development, including the direct link between music and improved reading ability (**R1** is a subsequent review article). A series of studies by Hallam demonstrated the value of background music in the primary school as a means of changing behaviour and enhancing learning (**R5**). 10-12 year-olds performed better in arithmetic and memory tasks with background music than without.

| |
|---|
| 3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references) |
|---|

- R1: Hallam, S., (2010) The power of music: Its impact on the intellectual, social and personal development of children and young people, *International Journal of Music Education*. **28**(3), 269-289.
- R2: Green, L. (2008) *Music, Informal Learning and the School: A New Classroom Pedagogy*, London: Ashgate Press.
- R3: Welch, G.F., Himonides, E., Saunders, J. & Papageorgi, I. (2010). *Researching the impact of the National Singing Programme 'Sing Up' in England: Main findings from the first three years (2007-2010). Children's singing development, self-concept and sense of social inclusion*. London: International Music Education Research Centre, IOE.
- R4: Welch, G., Ockelford, A., Carter, F., Zimmermann, S.-A. & Himonides, E. (2009). "Sounds of Intent": Mapping musical behaviour and development in children and young people with complex needs, *Psychology of Music*, **37**, 348-370.
- R5: Hallam, S., Price, J. and Katsarou, G. (2002) The Effects of Background Music on Primary School Pupils' Task Performance, *Educational Studies* **28**(2), 111-122.

Indicators of quality:

- IQ1: (**R1**) was *IJME*'s most downloaded article in 2010 and the original article was downloaded more than 2,000 times that year.
- IQ2: A symposium on Lucy Green's research was held at AERA in 2008 and the papers were later published in a special edition of the US journal, *Visions of Research in Music Education*. Special issues on her work have been published by the US journal *Action, Criticism and Theory in Music Education*, the *British Journal of Music Education*, and the Singapore Teachers' Academy for the Arts.
- IQ3: (**R3**) won a 2011 Arts and Health Award from the Royal Society for Public Health.

| |
|--|
| 4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words) |
|--|

Beneficiaries and dates of impact: IOE research has benefited people of all ages, including professional musicians, music teachers and the wider public. The focus of this case study is the impact of IOE research on school-aged children and their teachers in the UK and internationally, including children with special needs and from deprived backgrounds. The impact from 2008-13 has hit high points with the growth of Sing Up since 2008, Musical Futures (nationally and internationally) since 2010, the National Plan for Music Education in England in 2011 and the extraordinary growth of Sounds of Intent in 2013.

Reach and significance: Sing Up and Musical Futures (MF) have reached millions of children in the UK and abroad. By 2012, Sing Up had enhanced the learning and wellbeing of pupils in 96% of England's 17,000 primary schools, an estimated 4.2m children¹. Meanwhile, Sounds of Intent is

¹ Based on DfE figures showing an average of 200 pupils per primary school.

Impact case study (REF3b)

making an important difference to children with severe, or profound and multiple learning difficulties internationally through its ground-breaking web resource, accessed by 3m unique visitors since 2012. As demonstrated below, these programmes have *instrumental impact* (influencing policy and/or practice) and *capacity building impact*² – by changing or enhancing music teaching and learning – and *conceptual impact* – by broadening the way educators and governments think about music education.

Impact in primary schools: *Sing Up* was launched under the Labour Government’s Music Manifesto to ensure weekly singing in primary schools (**S4**). It was also highlighted in the Coalition’s 2011 Plan for Music Education (**S5**), which points up singing’s value to children and the school community (**R1, R3**) and commends *Sing Up*’s online resources (pp38-41). The IOE team helped shape the programme initially and developmentally through its evaluation programme, with Welch as its main research adviser. *Sing Up*’s programme director confirmed that the practical usefulness of Welch’s research and his depth of knowledge and reputation had helped them attract funding and “steer the strategic development of the entire programme” (**S1**). *Sing Up* became an independent charity when government funding ended in 2012. By July 2013, 4,650 schools had subscribed. *Sing Up* has boosted the confidence of thousands of primary teachers by providing brief, effective training and an activity-packed website – a much needed development. *Teacher training:* In 2008 EMI Sound Foundation funded music training for teachers in 150 primaries to the tune of £200,000, following 2007 research led by Hallam demonstrating knowledge gaps and lack of confidence. After she evaluated the scheme, it was rolled out to 30 more schools in 2010. The use of *background music* to improve behaviour and concentration has become common in schools in the wake of her studies showing its benefits, as countless articles in the Press attest (e.g. **S6**).

Impact in secondary schools: *Musical Futures* is making an impact in the UK and internationally. It “is regarded as one of the major advances in music-teaching pedagogy in this country since the turn of the century”, according to *Classroom Music* magazine (**S5**). The sponsor, Paul Hamlyn Foundation (PHF), and the Innovation Unit built on its success to develop a whole-school leadership programme aimed at engaging children in learning, encompassing the entire secondary curriculum. The project, Learning Futures (2008-10), was built into their Engaging Schools programme, which credits MF as a model (**S2**).

In the UK: more than 1,500 secondary schools in England (over a third) are incorporating this informal learning model. Following further pilots in 2012, MF is being rolled out in Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland, where, in 2013, KS3 MF students performed in a Derry/Londonderry City of Culture event. Recommended by the Music Manifesto, a partner in the programme (**S4**), it was endorsed by the previous Labour Government. An evaluation for its sponsor³ found that its introduction prompted a sharp rise in GCSE music enrolment, with above average results, improved behaviour and raised self-esteem. MF was also positively evaluated by Ofsted. A network of champion schools is developing MF methods and providing free CPD for neighbouring schools, and MF is part of PGCE courses including those at Trinity College of Music and the University of Wales, Cardiff.

In Australia MF is being used successfully by schools in Victoria, Queensland, New South Wales and South Australia. The model features in teacher education courses and MF Australia has its own Champion schools and website. An academic evaluation said: “After only two terms of implementation, the impact of the program on both the teachers and the students has been quite profound” (**S3**) and a report for the Victoria Government demonstrated its use across the Australian national curriculum. *In Brazil* a network of schools, co-ordinated by two universities, is adopting the informal learning model, and the Open University of Brazil is piloting it as a teacher-training unit. Music educators from four universities joined forces to train music teachers in MF and in 2012 state schools piloted MF in four major cities. *Cyprus* has a paragraph on MF in its national curriculum, in *Canada* it is supported by two school districts and in *Singapore* the informal learning model is being phased into schools and teacher education.

² Using Evidence: How Research can Inform Public Services (Nutley, S., Walter, I., Davis, H. 2007)

³ Hallam, S., Creech, A. & McQueen, H. (2011) *Musical Futures: a case study investigation: Final Report* IOE, University of London for the Paul Hamlyn Foundation

Impact case study (REF3b)

Impact on special education: Sounds of Intent's innovative website garnered an exceptional three million-plus visits from across every continent since its launch in 2012⁴, with some 150 schools and 1,000 pupils registered by July 31, 2013. In this collaborative project, which was highlighted by Ofsted, the IOE can take particular credit for enabling deep and extensive impact through this sophisticated web resource developed by Himonides (**S7**) to help change perceptions about the musical development that is possible with children and young people with complex needs. Between its launch in 2012 and July 31, 2013, more than 350,000 separate interactive teaching and learning resources were downloaded. The tool enables teachers, parents, therapists and carers to assess and record the musical progress over time even of children who can only blink one eyelid, and to share their own longitudinal data with other users. In 2012, the charity Sound About (**S8**) received funding for wider dissemination of this important resource and then trained teachers in 50 special schools during 2013.

Impact on policy: IOE findings (e.g. **R1**) lie behind the influential *Henley Review*, commissioned by Education Secretary Michael Gove for the Year of Music (2010) and the National Plan for Music Education that followed (**S5**). It was cited in 2010 by then schools minister Nick Gibb in the House of Commons and by Gove at the *Henley Review* launch. Gibb said: "Research commissioned by the DfE from the Institute of Education shows that 'quality' music education improves behaviour, attention and concentration and has a hugely positive effect on numeracy and language skills". Gove added: "It is simply unfair that the joy of musical discovery should be the preserve of those whose parents can afford it". Hallam also gave presentations to two All Party Parliamentary Groups on the wider benefits of music to children and young people. *Spending:* Surveys of local authority music services in 2005 and 2007 in England by Hallam and Andrea Creech helped provide the rationale for increased government investment in music education. The previous Labour government's *Music education and the music grant (Standards Fund 1.11)*, for 2008-11, explicitly acknowledges these surveys and lists the principal actions taken to address the issues they highlighted (**S9**). These included funding changes designed to encourage LAs to prioritise spending on KS2 instrumental and vocal programmes, an extra £40m to ensure pupils had access to the full range of instruments, and free CPD. The Coalition's *Plan for Music Education* also sought to overcome the postcode lottery highlighted by these and other IOE studies and maintained priorities such as high quality singing and instrumental learning for every child.

Additional international reach: IOE music researchers are sought around the world. For example, Hallam has provided advice on the development of music services in Australia and the US. Welch has been consulted about singing, teacher development and the evaluation of music initiatives in Italy, the US, Sweden, the Ukraine, South Africa and the United Arab Emirates.

| |
|---|
| 5. Sources to corroborate the impact⁵ (indicative maximum of 10 references) |
|---|

S1: Statement from former Programme Director, Sing Up (available).

S2: The Engaging School: A Handbook for School Leaders (2012), see page 12

http://www.innovationunit.org/sites/default/files/Engaging%20School%20Handbook_0.pdf

S3: Jeanneret, N. (2010), *Musical Futures: An Australian Perspective*, University of Melbourne Research Report. <https://www.musicalfutures.org/resource/27551> (link on right, under "Downloads")

S4: "Musical Futures Pathfinders and Research & Development Partners" (document available)

S5: DFE and DCMS (2011) <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/the-importance-of-music-a-national-plan-for-music-education>

S6: "Lessons with a change of tune", Glynys Hart, *TES*, 20/08/11

<http://www.tes.co.uk/article.aspx?storycode=6109318>

S7: <http://soundsofintent.org>

S8: <http://www.soundabout.org.uk/#/sounds-of-intent/4553518650>

S9: <http://www.education.gov.uk/b0014388/specific-grants-2008-11/standards-fund-2008-11>

⁴ While the exact number of individuals cannot be calculated, these are visits from more than 3 million unique IP addresses

⁵ All web links accessed 19/10/13