

Institution: London Metropolitan University
Unit of Assessment: Education
Title of case study: <i>Diversity and Citizenship in the Curriculum: Research Review</i>
<p>1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words)</p> <p>This research project directly led to changes to the English National Curriculum in 2007-08. It was commissioned by the DfES in 2006, following competitive tendering, to support the Ajebo review of the Citizenship Curriculum. In his report, Sir Keith Ajebo acknowledged our research provided 'an excellent background' for the review' (p5). Most research recommendations were adopted in the Ajebo review's recommendations, and a new element, <i>Identities and Diversity</i>, was introduced into the curriculum. The research has impacted on the education of all secondary-aged pupils, and on the initial and in-service training of primary and Citizenship teachers. Various analyses suggest this has significantly changed the teaching of young people about their own and others' identities, and contributed to civic cohesion.</p> <p>The work was disseminated and promoted in various ways by the team members.</p> <p>The identities element has been further supported by the EC's award of a personal Jean Monnet chair to Alistair Ross (2009-2014) to study young people's constructions of identity in the new post-2004 European states and the candidate states. As part of this, Ross has conducted 150 focus groups with young people in 15 countries: some early findings are included in the Outputs section, and a substantial book will be published by Routledge in 2014.</p>
<p>2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words)</p> <p>Objectives</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • analysing how diversity is promoted across the curriculum • considering whether (and if so, how) to incorporate 'Modern British Cultural and Social History' as a fourth element of the secondary citizenship programme. <p>Other aims included identifying contemporary British identities and values that are addressed through the National Curriculum (including international perspectives); and approaches to promoting shared values and a common sense of identities through teaching modern history.</p> <p>Findings and recommendations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The existing curriculum did not promote understanding of the plurality of groups in Britain, and should be changed to challenge those ideologies that construct the nation and national identity in ways that exclude minority ethnic groups. • Many teachers avoided teaching about diversity, or failed to explore diversities within ethnic categories, not promoting civic cohesion (Race Relations Amendment Act 2002). • A very narrow conceptualisation of Britishness was being taught within schools. • Incorporating Modern British Cultural and Social History into the citizenship curriculum was problematic. Definitions of 'Britishness' would be controversial and might leave some pupils feeling not fully included. Were it to be included, it should explore what modern British culture involves and cover issues such as British identity, immigration, and the contributions of diverse groups worldwide to different aspects of modern British life. • Implementing a more diverse curriculum requires schools and teachers to consider what is meant by 'diversity'. • The curriculum should allow pupils to understand and appreciate diversity and its values, and that they have their own identities within this diversity. A sensitive and controversial area: teachers would need to be given firm support from government, local authorities, school governors and heads. The citizenship curriculum is the most appropriate location. • We noted four characteristics of good school and curriculum practice: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ <i>Strong and effective leadership</i> in the area and support for teachers ○ <i>Planning and guidance</i>: to avoid repeat study of the same groups and guidance for teachers

Impact case study (REF3b)

teaching about diversity in mainly White schools.

- *The use of pupils' own experiences* in talking about diversity and identities, to reduce idealisation and stereotyping.
- *The use of pupils' idealism*: this would be useful in developing teaching strategies that encompass diversity and identities.

Methods

- Detailed cases studies of six ethnically and geographically diverse schools across England:
 - Semi-structured interviews (heads and citizenship and history/ humanities teachers)
 - Focus groups with a hundred pupils (8 – 17)
 - Observations of lessons, assemblies, school debates
 - Analysis of policies and schemes of work related to diversity and citizenship
- Literature review, particularly of European material and 'grey' literature

Timescale

June to December 2006

Research Team

Dr Uvanney Maylor (Senior Research Fellow); Barbara Read (Research Fellow); Heather Mendick (SRF); Alistair Ross (Professor); Nicola Rollock (RF).

The team were all full-time staff of London Metropolitan University for the whole of the project. All were involved in fieldwork, analysis and the writing the report. Maylor and Ross liaised with the Ajegbo Commission. We have researched citizenship education within the curriculum since the late 1990s, coordinating an EC Academic Network from 1998 (Children's Identity and Citizenship in Europe). We have carried out several research projects with partners in different EU states

Key contextual information

The London bombings of July 2005 prompted widespread discussion on how some British-born citizens were so alienated from British society that they carried out acts of terrorism. As a consequence, in May 2006 the DFES commissioned Keith Ajegbo to review the role of education in promoting national identity and citizenship, and specifically to consider how ethnic, religious and cultural diversity might be addressed in the curriculum.

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

Maylor, U., Read, B., Mendick, H., Ross, A. and Rollock, n.; *Diversity and Citizenship in the Curriculum: Research Review*; 2007; Department for Education and Skills Research Report RR819; ISBN 978 1 84478 875 0 - Available at www.education.gov.uk/publications/eOrderingDownload/RR819.pdf

Ross A, (2008) *A European Education*. Stoke on Trent: Trentham (Chapter 7; pp 91-104)

Maylor, U. (2010) Notions of diversity, British identities and citizenship belonging, *Race, Ethnicity and Education*. 13 (2):233-252.

Grant details: The Grant was entitled *Diversity and Citizenship in the Curriculum: a Research Review* and was awarded by the Department for Education and Skills through a competitive tendering process. The grant was for £56,000.

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

Most of Ajegbo's (2007) *Curriculum Review: Diversity and Citizenship* recommendations stem from our research, particularly concerning

- then current approaches to identity and diversity in schools
- pupils' and teachers' concerns about these areas
- the need for further teacher education, resources and leadership
- the characteristics of good practice

Members of the research team had meetings with the Ajegbo Commission in 2006 to review drafts of the Review. These led to substantial editing on the nature of multiple identities and how they affected diversity (in particular, how some Muslim young people successfully combined British and

Impact case study (REF3b)

other identities).

The Review's findings were accepted by the Secretary of State, and the QCA subsequently revised the National Curriculum. The 2007 programme of study included a new element, *Identities and Diversity: Living together in the UK*, in which Citizenship supported community cohesion. The Citizenship Programme of study for key stages 3 and 4 lists key concepts reflect closely the findings of our research: http://curriculum.qcda.gov.uk/uploads/QCA-07-3329-pCitizenship3_tcm8-396.pdf -

- Appreciating that identities are complex, can change over time and are informed by different understandings of what it means to be a citizen in the UK.
- Exploring the diverse national, regional, ethnic and religious cultures, groups and communities in the UK and the connections between them.
- Considering the interconnections between the UK, the rest of Europe and the wider world.
- Exploring community cohesion and the forces that change in communities over time.

The revised national curriculum took effect from 2007/8, and had been used in every successive year, thus impacting on all pupils in England since 2008.

The QCA also produced cross curricula guidance in which identity and diversity featured as one of seven dimensions to be considered by schools when designing and planning their whole curriculum. (QCA, *Cross-curriculum dimensions: A planning guide for schools*: <http://schoolsonline.britishcouncil.org/sites/default/files/el/98010.pdf> (2009).

The Agebgo Review recommended (following our identification of a significant lack of knowledge of available resources) that the DfES commission a review of existing educational resources covering issues that explicitly relate to teaching about identity and diversity in the Citizenship curriculum.

This was undertaken by the Citizenship Foundation (http://www.citizenshipfoundation.org.uk/lib_res_pdf/0747.pdf).

The Research also impacted on the Higher Education curriculum for teachers of Citizenship.

The Professional Standards for Teachers Qualified Teacher Status were revised by the TDA in September 2007 http://www.tda.gov.uk/teacher/developing-career/professional-standards-guidance/~media/resources/teacher/professional-standards/standards_qts.pdf to include a revised set of professional attributes concerning diversity (Q18 -20) and the requirement (Q25) that teachers take practical account of diversity and promoting equality and inclusion. The Revised *Teachers' Standards*, effective from 1 September 2012 also refer to Fundamental British values and include references to the Report's findings (<http://media.education.gov.uk/assets/files/pdf/t/teachers%20standards.pdf>).

All relevant initial teacher education has been revised to include these changes. The University of Exeter write "the fact that this area was now statutory was significant - it ensured that we explored these important issues of race and diversity. This was particularly important in the South West where there is still a tendency for schools to think 'there is no problem here'". Their Professional Studies course for primary and secondary students has a lead lecture on diversity which refers extensively to the Report. The University of York "welcomed the opportunity offered by the addition of the Identities and Diversity strand to the ... curriculum. We made alterations to the PGCE programme so that this significant area could be developed better by trainee teachers. We see links between this area and the building of community cohesion." (Both communications available in full on request)

A further outcome was the DCFS created a duty for schools to promote community cohesion. Non-statutory *Guidance on the duty to promote Community Cohesion* was published in 2007 (www.education.gov.uk/publications/eOrderingDownload/DCSF-00598-2007.pdf), and repeatedly quotes the Agebgo report and the 'Identity and Diversity' strand in citizenship education.

The inclusion of identity-related elements in the Citizenship curriculum has strengthened the subject, and demonstrated its effectiveness in promoting and maintaining community cohesion. This is evidenced in the 2012-13 consultation on the National Curriculum: 61% of those expressing an opinion on Citizenship wanted it to be retained: they 'believed that pupils should learn about ... the challenges of living in a diverse society. that it was essential to retain a statutory Programme of Study to ensure that issues such as racism, discrimination, diversity and inclusion were covered by all schools, in all year groups.' (Department for Education (2013) *Review of the*

Impact case study (REF3b)

National Curriculum in England: Summary Report of the Call for Evidence. p 59). Thus in turn contributed to the present Government's decision to retain the subject (Hansard *Official Report*, Vol. 550, c. 655, 7 February 2013).

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

In addition to the QCA, TDA, DFES references above to the direct impact, the following provide independent corroboration of the impact:

1. Keating A, Kerr D, Lopes J, Featherstone G and Benton T (2009) *Embedding Citizenship Education in Secondary Schools in England (2002-08): Citizenship Education Longitudinal Study, Seventh Annual Report* Slough: NFER (ISBN 978 1 84775 557 5 : "this latter strand .. considerably alters the original focus of the citizenship curriculum and makes explicit its role in educating not just for political literacy but increasingly for community cohesion, as recommended by ... *Ajagbo, 2007.*" (p 6) (<http://www.nfer.ac.uk/research/projects/cels/about-the-study.cfm>)
2. Brett, P (2007) *Identity and Diversity: Citizenship Education and looking forwards from the Ajagbo Report* CitizED/TDA <http://www.citized.info/pdf/commarticles/Peter%20Brett%20-%20Identity%20and%20Diversity.doc>
3. Clemitshaw, G and Jerome, L. (2009) *Can citizenship education promote democracy and Britishness? A survey of trainee teachers' attitudes on the purposes of citizenship education.* CitizED/TDA (www.citized.info/pdf/commarticles/Citized British Professional Report FINAL May09.doc)
4. Institute for Community Cohesion (2008) *Our Shared Futures* <http://www.schoolslinkingnetwork.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2011/07/DCSF-iCoCo-January-2008-Community-cohesion-useful-links-for-schools.pdf>
5. Jerome, L (2009) *Briefing Paper for Trainee Teachers of Citizenship Education: Identities and Diversity – Assessment Task for Year 11.* CitizED/TDA (<http://www.citized.info/pdf/commarticles/Lee%20Jerome.pdf>)
6. Nuffield Foundation/ACT (2009) *The Contribution of Citizenship Education to Schools, Communities and Individuals: Citizenship Education Seminar* (http://www.teachingcitizenship.org.uk/dnloads/seminar_report.pdf)
7. Osler, A. (2009) Citizenship education, democracy and racial justice 10 years on. *Race Equality Teaching* 27(3): 21-27.
8. Slight B (2011) What is the nature of Citizenship education?: A critical investigation of the development of the European dimension as an aim of Citizenship education. TDA/Citized <http://www.citized.info/pdf/students/Slight.pdf>
9. Starkey, H. (2008) Diversity and Citizenship in the Curriculum. *London Review of Education*, 6, 3-8.

Evidence of European-wide impact: the report was cited several times (with examples) in the Teacher Education training manual:

P4I - *Playing for Interculturality; Recommendations for the Development of Informal Intercultural Training Itineraries* (2011) Ref. 518475-LLP-1-2011-1-ES-GRUNDTVIG-GMP