Institution: City University London
Unit of Assessment: 36 Communication, Cultural and Media Studies, Library and Information Management
Title of case study: Journalists in Danger: Impunity and the Rule of Law

1. Summary of the impact

The number of journalists killed or injured in the course of their work around the world has increased. In many places journalists lack the basic protection of the law and an independent justice system. The Initiative on Journalists in Danger: Impunity and the Rule of Law is playing an agenda-setting role in a campaign including non-governmental and inter-governmental bodies. It led to the adoption of the United Nations Plan of Action on the Safety of Journalists and the Issue of Impunity in 2010 and Implementation Strategy 2013-2014.

The initiative has achieved impact on public engagement, policy-making and civil society by: 1) shedding light on the problem of crimes against journalists by contributing detailed evidence on the number of human rights violations in different countries; 2) campaigning to safeguard the personal and professional integrity of journalists worldwide; 3) providing expert advice to governments, NGOs and international organisations to define legislation and understanding to prevent crimes against media freedom; and 4) creating an international platform of academic and legal expertise aimed at knowledge exchange about how to combat violence against journalists; and enhancing the right of citizens to be informed and facilitating public engagement with this pressing issue.

2. Underpinning research

The Initiative on *Journalists in Danger*, established in 2010 as a joint project of City University London's *Centre for Law, Justice and Journalism* (CLJJ) and the University of Sheffield's *Centre for Freedom of the Media* (CFOM), was directed by Tumber and Woods from City University London and Horsley and Harrison from the University of Sheffield. Professor Tumber has been a faculty member of City since 1988 and Director of the CLJJ. Professor Woods joined City in 2008 and was the Director of Law for CLJJ until August 2013. The project aims to provide an independent platform to assess the effectiveness of existing legal, political and institutional safeguards against violence directed at journalists and to present the case for more effective international mechanisms to counter such crimes and end impunity. Underpinning the Initiative are monographs, research papers, desk-based research, a database, a conference and collaborative consultations among academics, legal experts and national and inter-governmental organisations, examples of which are given below.

A series of publications shaped the development of the sociological part of the Initiative. These included *Media at war: the Iraq Crisis* (2004) [1], co-authored by Tumber and Palmer (Emeritus Professor at London Metropolitan University), which offered an analytical account and provided inspiration for future research and an invaluable framework to journalists and other audiences for understanding how war coverage and media organisations operate in situations of violent conflict. Tumber and Webster's monograph, *Journalists under Fire* (2006) [2] constituted the first book that compiled detailed empirical research on frontline journalism. The legal aspects of the research were produced by Xenos (Research Assistant in The City Law School during this time) who conducted a systematic review of existing human rights and international legislation, which informed subsequent research. Dr Draghici (Law, at City since 2009) and Woods produced a Legal Instruments Study for the Safety of Journalists and the issue of Impunity that was published at the Headquarters of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) on 13th and 14th September 2011 [5]. The Initiative also presented several reports providing material for collaborative consultation with members of The Open Society Foundation, Norwegian PEN and UNESCO. A complementary Political Aspects Study was produced by Horsley (CFOM) in May 2011 in the form of a free-standing pamphlet. It is available on the Sheffield, City and Social Sciences Research Network websites.

A comprehensive database detailing key organisations in the protection of human rights, freedom of information and safety of journalists was compiled by Dr Dinardi (Research Officer at City since 2009) to inform the conference at City University London in 2011.

3. References to the research

1. Tumber H. & Palmer J. (2004). *Media at War: the Iraq Crisis*. London: Sage Publications.
2. Tumber H. & Webster F. (2006). *Journalists under Fire: Information War and Journalistic Practices*. London: Sage Publications.
3. Tumber H. (2006). The Fear of Living Dangerously: Journalists who report on Conflict. *Journal of International Relations, 20(4), 439-451.*
4. Tumber H. (2008). Journalists, War Crimes and International Justice. *Media War and Conflict, 1(3), 261-269.*
5. Draghici C. & Woods L. (2011). *Safety and Protection of Journalists: A Responsibility for the World.* Legal Instruments Study for the Initiative on Impunity and the Rule of Law Research. London: CLJJ, City University London.
   Published as a free-standing pamphlet on the websites of CFOM (www.cfom.org.uk/impunity/research/) and City (www.city.ac.uk/__data/assets/pdf_file/0014/124304/Impunity_report_9th_FINAL-August.pdf) and on the Social Sciences Research Network (http://ssrn.com/abstract=2241802). The pamphlet was initially distributed at the Working Conference on the Safety and Protection of Journalists: A Responsibility for the World, The City Law School on 1st June 2011.
6. Xenos D. (2011). Mapping the UN and Regional Human Rights Treaties and Systems. London: City University London. Scoping exercise for Impunity and the Rule of Law, includes 8 research papers available online: www.city.ac.uk/centre-for-law-justice-and-journalism/publications

References 1 and 2 are monographs published by Sage which is well-recognised for the quality of its publications. References 3 and 4 are published in peer-reviewed journals. Reference 5 is a recognised point of reference. It has been cited in UNESCO's Concept Note on the 1st UN Inter-agency Meeting on Safety of Journalists and the Issue of Impunity (13th and 14th September 2011, Paris):
www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CI/CI/pdf/un_interagency_meeting_safety_journalist_concept_paper_en.pdf.

4. Details of the impact

The Impunity and the Rule of Law Initiative produced a positive impact on public engagement, policy making and civil society; and influenced international legislation and NGO practices concerning human rights, freedom of information and protection of journalists. This was visible during the '*Working Conference of the Initiative on Impunity and the Rule of Law*'. The event, held at City on 1st June 2011, was attended by many stakeholders including senior members of international and intergovernmental organisations including UNESCO, Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) and Inter-American Committee on Human Rights, journalists' federations and expert NGOs including Amnesty, Article 19, Journalistes en Danger, Reporters without Borders and the Red Cross, among many others. Participants included Assistant Director-General of UNESCO Janis Karklins and Director of Human Rights of the UK Foreign Office Susan Hyland. UNESCO considered the conference to be a major international and interdisciplinary event aimed at developing new global initiatives intended to protect journalists and end the impunity of those who murder, assault or threaten them. UNESCO stated on its website (2011) that the Initiative which had organised the conference '*has already received the backing of Archbishop Desmond Tutu, a long-time advocate for the worldwide protection of journalists' rights*' who also sent a special message to the conference.

The conference marked the launch of a topical report by the New York-based NGO, Committee to Protect Journalists (CPJ) which revealed that 13 countries around the world had five or more

unsolved cases of murdered journalists committed during the past decade. The conference attracted sponsorship and funding from important organisations (the Open Society Institute - £1,047; the Norwegian PEN Centre which works defending freedom of expression and advocating human rights worldwide - £1,334; and the Swedish National Commission for UNESCO - £3,943). As co-director of the Initiative, Tumber provided the welcoming and introductory remarks at the conference which started the process of consultation and set the precedents for the International Programme for the Development of Communication (IPDC) at the United Nations' first Inter-Agency Meeting with the UNESCO States members on 13th and 14th September 2011. UNESCO made use of the Initiative's London Conference as a preparatory meeting for its Inter-Agency Meeting in Paris and stated on its website: '*As a first step towards this event [the UN Inter-Agency meeting], a meeting entitled Safety and Protection for Journalists: A Responsibility for the World was organized in June 2011 by the Initiative on Impunity and the Rule of Law. The conclusions drawn from this meeting will be presented at the UN Inter-Agency Meeting in Paris.*' Research and policy proposals prepared by our research team became reference materials for this meeting. Archbishop Desmond Tutu's speech at the conference raised awareness about the violence against media workers throughout society and appealed to world governments for urgent intervention. Draghici and Woods delivered proposals based on previous research (the scoping exercise) carried out by Xenos, to strengthen existing UN mechanisms for increasing co-operation and preventing attacks against journalists.

The Initiative produced a valuable impact on public engagement by creating an international platform of academic and legal expertise comprising governmental and non-governmental experts from organisations (including International Bar Associations, Index on Censorship, OSCE, Columbia Law School, Saferworld, the UK House of Lords, The Salzburg Global Seminar and UN, Media Legal Defence Initiative and International News Safety Institute) to seek acceptance for fighting violence against journalists and the right of citizens to be informed. A list of relevant resources and working papers is accessible on the Initiative website.

The role played by Gaber (Professor of Journalism at City) and the UK Government's representative on the Intergovernmental Council of the UN's International Programme for the Development of Communication based at UNESCO, was crucial. Gaber, an active contributor to the Initiative, persuaded the Council to direct UNESCO to convene a meeting of all UN agencies to draw up and implement a plan to increase journalists' safety and hold governments accountable for the impunity provided to their assailants. The UK Ambassador at UNESCO, Matthew Sudders, singled out Gaber as a key contributor to the process in a letter sent on 24th August 2012 to the Director of the Freedom of Expression and Media Development UN Division. The UN officially adopted the proposal and Gaber represented the UK at a meeting in Vienna in November 2012 of all relevant UN agencies, national governments and international organisations. The meeting heard progress reports on the implementation of the plan so far and made recommendations for future action. Gaber's crucial role in getting the Initiative underway was noted in a House of Commons debate by Don Foster MP on 21st March 2012 [7]. In August 2012 Tumber was asked by the UK National Commission for UNESCO for input into a review of UNESCO's draft work plan on the Safety of Journalists and the Issue of Impunity and to comment on the draft of the UK response to the UNESCO Plan [8].

The CLJJ organised a further conference on '*Obstacles to free speech and the Safety of Journalists*' on 2nd May 2013, an activity which forms part of and is specifically referenced in the UNESCO Implementation Strategy 2013-2014 [9].

The consultation proved crucial to shaping policy interventions and the coordination of inter-agency mechanisms. It suggested high-level expert consultations for the Austrian government at the UN Human Rights Council and informed the final UN Action Plan to combat violence against journalists on how to monitor progress at both national and international levels. This Action Plan, prepared during the first UN Inter-Agency Meeting on the safety of journalists and the issue of impunity, will establish an inter-agency mechanism to monitor progress and assist countries in the development of legislation favouring freedom of expression. Evidence of the application of the recommendations made by the Impunity Initiative at City can be identified in the UNESCO 2013-2014 strategy on freedom of speech (p.28) [10].

5. Sources to corroborate the impact

7. www.publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201212/cmhansrd/cm120321/halltext/120321h0001.htm

8. www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CI/CI/pdf/official_documents/Implementation_Strategy_2013-2014_REV8march.pdf (page 17).

9. Email acknowledgement on 22nd August 2012 by the UK National Commission for UNESCO Policy and Research Officer.

10. www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CI/CI/pdf/official_documents/Implementation_Strategy_2013-2014_REV8march.pdf.

The project impact can be further corroborated via UNESCO's website: www.unesco.org/new/en/communication-and-information/events/calendar-of-events/events-websites/inter-agency-meeting-on-the-safety-of-journalists-and-the-issue-of-impunity.

This indicates the importance of the conclusion and presentations of the June 2011 City University London meeting to the UN Inter-Agency Meeting in Paris.

The importance of the draft created by the Initiative to assess and improve the existing legal, political and institutional mechanisms to protect the work of journalists was mentioned on: www.unesco.org/new/en/media-services/single-view/news/first_steps_taken_to_adopt_a_united_nations_plan_of_action_to_improve_safety_of_journalists_and_combat_impunity/ and www.unesco.org/new/en/media-services/single-view/news/major_conference_aims_to_lead_the_fight_against_impunity_of_those_who_mistreat_journalists/ where the importance of the conference is also indicated.

UNESCO has also recommended the CLJJ Initiative's work: www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CI/CI/pdf/un_interagency_meeting_safety_journalist_concept_paper_en.pdf.

Measures for improving journalists' protection and inter-agency cooperation mechanisms suggested by the Initiative received international recognition on UNESCO's website: www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CI/CI/pdf/WPFD/UN%20Plan%20of%20Action_Safety%20of%20Journalists.pdf.

The Initiative provided analysis and advice to the UK Foreign Office in preparation for the important UNESCO (Paris) meeting on 22nd 23rd March where the UN Action Plan was debated (in the UNESCO IPDC Council) and a decision was taken to prepare a detailed UNESCO Work Plan on the Safety and Impunity issues: www.unesco.org/new/en/media-services/single-view/news/ipdc_council_session_asks_unesco_director_general_to_prepare_work_plan_on_the_safety_of_journalists_and_the_issue_of_impunity.

Gaber shaped the drafting of the UN programme on the safety of journalists, available on: www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CI/CI/pdf/IPDC/ipdc_dg_safety_report_rev.pdf.

The UK Ambassador - Permanent Delegate to UNESCO thanks Gaber for his input. The Assistant, Freedom of Expression and Media Development Division, Communication and Information Sector, UNESCO on behalf of UNESCO's Assistant Director-General for Communication and Information, can confirm the letter of invitation concerning the 2nd UN Inter-Agency Meeting on the Safety of Journalists and the Issue of Impunity. A letter from the Chairman of the UK National Commission for UNESCO confirms with thanks Gaber's important role in helping the Commission develop its views on the impunity of journalism as it formulates such policy advice.

The UN also clearly states the key role of the CLJJ at City University London in the production of a UN Reviewed Draft Plan on Safety of Journalists and Combating Impunity (Review of Draft UNESCO Plan on Safety of Journalists and Combating Impunity, 2012; p2).

Tumber's input to the response by the UK National Commission for UNESCO to the proposed UN Draft Plan of Action for the Safety of Journalists can be confirmed by the Senior Communications and Research Officer and Policy and Research Officer, UK National Commission for UNESCO on behalf of the Director for Communication and Information, UK National Commission for UNESCO.

The impact on other international organisations can be verified in the OSCE official publication: Guidebook on Safety of Journalists based on the work of the Impunity and the Rule of Law Initiative - available on the OSCE website www.osce.org/fom/85777. This recognises the legal obligations and recommended practices for the 56 participating States of the organisation.