

<p>Institution: Liverpool Hope University</p>
<p>Unit of Assessment: 25 [Education]</p>
<p>a. Overview - Strategic decisions during the period of review altered the staffing demographic and continued the evolution of a sustainable, thriving, dynamic and participatory research culture. Liverpool Hope during 2001-2007 evolved from a College of Higher Education to a University; achieving Research Degree Awarding powers in August 2009. Building on its historical roots, in high quality professional practice, the University and Faculty's aim is to create an environment which promotes cutting-edge research and professional practice which informs the Academy, the teaching of our students and develops partnerships with those outside the Academy. During 2009-2013 a clearly articulated recruitment, training and research strategy underpinned the University's mission to make significant change in academic staff's research qualification and publication and to the culture of the Faculty. This strategy has facilitated an increase in staff holding doctoral qualification from 14 in 2008 to 46 (PH.D – 43; Ed.D – 3) in 2013 with a further 25 staff working towards the award of PHD (15) and professional doctorates (10). <i>This means that 87% of the academic staff of the Faculty either hold or are working towards doctoral qualification.</i> The vision of research at Liverpool Hope is based on the premise that research should contribute to the development of society through education. Within the Faculty research is not seen as passively observing social phenomena and commenting on these in a neutral way but that research and teaching should be <i>concerned with the humanising of people and of society through education.</i></p>
<p>b. Research strategy</p> <p>i) Evaluation of RAE 2008 - RAE 2008 declared that the Faculty would substantially enhance research activity, further develop the research centres and place research at the heart of the Faculty's work. This commitment has been honoured. The culture of research in the Faculty is now underpinned by an aim to publish world leading research through articles and monographs and to make the local community and the world a better place. The Faculty has made rigorous, original and significant contributions to knowledge and supported informed development of public policy and professional practice through engagement with professional leaders, policy-makers, practitioners and engagement with local communities. [see REF 3a - and iv below]. Since RAE 2008, expansion of research has been achieved through the contributions of the Research Centres [detailed at v]. The evolution of the Centres defined cogent research areas and gave leadership and strategic direction to academic staff. Over the Review Period centre members have made key contributions to national capacity-building in educational research [ESRC Teacher Education Research Network project] and have actively brought research insights to bear on the formation of national policies through membership of the DfE consultation groups [<i>Green and Hodkinson</i>].</p> <p>ii) Substantive development of research environment over the Review Period include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • established excellence in research in Christian Education through outstanding appointments, publications and funded research; and, • a new, highly innovative programme of Professional Education Doctorate; <p>iii) Research Structure - Institutionally, research is directed by the University Research Committee - chaired by the PVC [Professor Newport]- which reports directly to Senate. At Faculty level, research is led by Professor Gibson who also sits on the University Research Committee. Others lead the research Centres within the Faculty [<i>detailed v</i>]. The three Faculties articulate their strategy within the parameters of this, and each Dean monitors research activity within the area annually. The Faculty during the period of review has created a strengthened and realistic research strategy and has begun to evolve an Impact Strategy. This is intended to engage staff in research that has significant impact. This Strategy sets out key areas which Faculty believe need to be researched and seeks out resources and researchers to undertake such activity. The Research and Impact Strategy are grounded on the Faculty's wish to improve people and society through research. Research therefore must be based on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a vision that is concerned with the humanising of people and of society through education; • contributing to the development of society through education; • processes that are collaborative; and, • the personal commitment of all staff. <p>iv) The Research Strategy - ensures that the Faculty:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • offers a first-rate research environment to those who seek intellectual growth and personal

Environment template (REF5)

professional development;

- emerges as a first-rate department in the wider context of education; and,
- academic staff develop as scholars in their subjects, in a vibrant academic community.

Further, it builds:

- capacity for increasing postgraduate students with experienced supervisors;
- research collaboration with other institutions and organisational networks [*for example Hope has hosted research-led Conferences/Seminars in the period, -Collaborative Action Research Network (CARN) events (2009) – funded ESRC Seminar Series Global perspectives with University of Exeter; see REF 3a.*]

The Strategy lays a clear expectation on staff to identify, apply for and win external research funding. External funding applications are supported by the University Research Facilitator who, working in partnership with academics, aims to secure, manage and increase funding from external organisations. In addition, workshops and internal 'pump-priming' funds support academics in developing skills and research of a standard suitable for applying to external funding sources. Income from research are administered by Newport, a committee of five senior members of the University and the relevant Dean. Annually, priorities for research funding are decided by Research Committee. In recent years funding has:

- enabled staff to present papers at conferences [*Dr. Hodkinson -International Congress of Qualitative Research - Illinois, Dr. Stuart-Buttle 18th Annual Sloan Consortium International Conference on Online Learning, Florida, Dr. Lewin Laval-Virtual Conference, France, Dr. Lundie Association of Moral Education and International Society for Sociology of Religions*]
- visit specialist libraries, archives and resource collections for research purposes [*Dr. Guilherme visited the Buber Archives at the Jewish National University Library, Jerusalem to conduct research on a monograph on Martin Buber*];
- purchase specialist equipment.

v) Research Centres-Variety of research is important to the Faculty as is the quality. To facilitate effective identification and development of research strengths, to further evolve its impact strategy, to monitor the health of its constituent disciplines and to promote interdisciplinary, the Faculty's research is articulated through the activities of the **Research Centres**. For REF 2014, the Faculty's strategic plan focuses on five research centres. These being the: **National Centre for Christian Education; Child, Family and Society; Cultural and Disability Studies; International and Development Education**; and, the recently created **Centre for Science and Mathematics Education**. In addition, the Institute for Research into Education and Society is a collaborative project between the Faculty of Education and St Xavier's College, Mumbai. The Institute is part of the strategic drive by the University and the Faculty to develop international partnerships with high quality institutions. In 2012 a '**Special Interest Group**' in the **Philosophy of Education**, supported by a grant of £3,000 from the University, was also established. The key objectives of these Centres were to provide a supportive academic environment which promotes:

- clear research leadership through the Centre Directors and the Director of Research;
- a stronger basis for mentoring relationships so that new researchers flourish;
- a critical mass of activity around a limited number of cross collaborative themes;
- a coordinated and strategic seminar and public lecture programme;
- excellent support structures for doctoral students;
- improved recruitment of good PGR students;
- more integration of research and teaching agendas; and,
- a collective responsibility for bidding for competitive research.

The achievements of the Centres may be summarised thus:

National Centre for Christian Education (NcfCE): Director - Dr. Green. Key Members: Dr. Torevell & Prof. Sullivan. Visiting scholars: Prof. Cooling, Christchurch Canterbury, Prof. Hughes, Queens University Belfast, Prof. Grace, Institute of Education, London University, Prof. Shortt, Professorial fellow, Liverpool Hope University, Prof. Schuttloffel, Catholic University of America, Washington. The Centre's aims are to:

- provide an international hub of research activity focussed on the opportunities and challenges facing Christian education at the present time;

Environment template (REF5)

- work collaboratively and creatively with the department of Theology, Philosophy and Religious Studies, Religious Education Services and Philosophy of Education Special Interest Group to promote excellence in Christian education;
- provide a supportive environment for master's and doctoral students conducting research into aspects of Christian and Religious Education;
- assist in the creative articulation of the mission, aims and defining characteristics of faith schools and other related bodies through research findings and publications, conferences, continuing professional development and consultancy; and,
- support the provision of excellence in Religious Education and collective worship in faith schools.

Research income and charitable donation for the Centre has been significant during the past five years. It has worked on 12 research projects during the Review Period. There have been 15 peer-reviewed papers produced in this time, four books and seven book chapters. It currently has seven PhD students and 10 Ed. D students 'housed' within the Centre. Green is currently a peer-reviewer for the Oxford Review of Education, Journal of Education and Christian Belief and Journal of Christian Belief.

Centre for Child, Family and Society(CfFS): Director—Dr. Walton. Key Members: Professor Whitehead(Adjunct Professor)Dr. Kum. The Centre's aims to:

- create, advance and disseminate knowledge to enhance the wellbeing of children locally, nationally and globally;
- translate excellence and inspirational learning and teaching into research into learning opportunities for postgraduates and continuing professional development;
- promote inter-professional working, and actively research ways in which different professionals can work together in the best interests of children, families and wider society; and,
- actively grow research and third stream income.

Research and income for the Centre has grown during the period of review and this has funded six projects- mostly working with early years practitioners in deprived areas of Liverpool. There have also been eight peer-reviewed papers, one book and three book chapters. Currently three PhD students and three Ed. D students are 'housed' within the Centre. Walton is a peer-reviewer and member of editorial board for *the Educational Journal of Living Theories* and a reviewer for *Teaching and Teaching Education*.

Centre for Cultural and Disability Studies(CfCDS): Director – Dr. Bolt. Key Members: Dr. Hodkinson, Dr. Cheyne (returned under UOA D29). The focus of the Centre is to challenge and change all aspects of dehumanising practice and to fully acknowledge the ontology and epistemology of people who are disabled. This focus often pertains to the content of courses, the dire need for curricular reform within schools, colleges and universities. The Centre, therefore, has interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary relevance within the field of education, English and Medical ethics. There have been 50 pieces in peer-reviewed journals produced in this time, three books and 10 book chapters. In addition, the Centre's own international peer-reviewed periodical, the *Journal of Literary & Cultural Disability Studies*, produces three issues per year and is produced in print and online via Liverpool University Press and Project MUSE. The CCDS currently has two Ed. D students 'housed' within the Centre. Bolt is Editor in Chief of the *Journal of Literary & Cultural Disability Studies*, Co-editor of the proposed book series, *Literary Disability Studies*, founder of the International Network of Literary & Cultural Disability Scholars and serves on the editorial boards of *Disability & Society* and *Journal of Visual Impairment and Blindness*. Hodkinson is Executive Committee Member of the British Education Studies Association and has been a peer-reviewer for ten academic journals.

Centre for International and Development Education (CfIDE): Dr. Guilherme. Key Members: Dr. Su. Dr. Bamber. Dr. Lewin. Dr. Lundie, Dr. White.

The Centre, established in 2010, supports staff and doctoral students in developing research in this increasingly important area. The Centre also provides a focal point for work with the Institute of Education and Society. The Centre's aims are to:

- support staff in producing research of national and international significance;
- disseminate research outcomes through presentations, publications and media;
- promote collaborative scholarship, research and establish links with external institutions and individuals in the cogent areas of international perspectives on education and

Environment template (REF5)

Development Education; and,

- provide a forum for the development of an interdisciplinary culture between academics, professionals and experts involved in international settings.

Research and third stream income for the Centre has grown during the period of review. It has worked on 10 research projects most notably the Rural Hybrid system [EPSRC], the Development Awareness Fund [Dept. for International Development] and a European Commission project for Language Integration. There have been 18 peer-reviewed papers produced in this time, seven books and 19 book chapters and a seminar series. It currently has a PH.d student funded by the Higher Education Academy within the Centre.

Centre for Advanced Pedagogy (CfAP): Director: Dr. Owens. Key members: Dr. Su; Emeritus Prof. Lin Norton. **Visiting Scholars:** Emeritus Prof. David Nicol and Emeritus Prof. Dai Hounsell. The Centre houses staff with a research focus on learning and teaching across a range of contextual settings. The CfAP promotes a community of scholarship and research which supports staff in their academic and professional development. The Centre's main objective is to provide a framework for supporting staff in developing research related to pedagogy. It has worked on three research projects during the Review Period [The use of iPads in higher education teaching; Re-energising undergraduate research methods in education pedagogy'; and 'OFSTED Analysis of faith-based schools' with the *NCfCE*]. Their seminar series has involved national speakers such as Profs., Roger Brown (Adjunct Professor), Dai Hounsell, Lin Norton, Glynis Cousins and Dr. Paul Ashwin. Two peer-reviewed papers have been produced in this time, and one book chapter. It has one PH.d student and two Ed.D students 'housed' within the Centre. It leads a consortium (with Derby University) on the National Teaching Fellowship project: Flying Start: Practices, Communities and Policies to Ease the Transition to University Writing and Assessment. Consortium partner (lead Aston University) in peer mentoring for success project. Consortium partner (lead London Metropolitan University) in Write NoW and secured CETL funding for a five year project (2005-10).

Centre for Science and Mathematics Education(CfSME): Director Dr. Almond. The aims of the Centre are:

- to support informed-by-research activities for the teaching and learning of science and mathematics;
- to develop resources for primary and secondary schools, and in-service teachers programs, inspired by research in Inquiry Based Education, related to Science and Mathematics;
- to interface between School Science, Mathematics and STEM, immersing students in a learning environment in order to understand how scientists solve problems and develop scientific paradigms; and,
- produce software exploiting the use of Computer and Computational Science in Natural Sciences and Mathematics.

Special Interest Group in the Philosophy of Education:

Key Members: Dr. Lewin (Returned under UOAD33), Dr Guilherme; Dr Lundie; Dr. White.

This SIG provides a forum for discussion of philosophical issues that arise in educational contexts. They provide a hub for lectures, seminars, and research, including those hosted under the auspices of the *Philosophy of Education Society of Great Britain* (PESGB - North West England Branch). The SIG hosted a PESGB part funded conference in June 2012 and has since hosted a series of speakers from around the country. Nine articles (*Journal of Philosophy of Education; Educational Philosophy and Theory; International Journal of Lifelong Education*), an edited volume *New Perspectives in Philosophy of Education* (Bloomsbury 2014), and a co-authored book entitled *Buber and Education: Dialogue as Conflict Resolution* (Routledge 2013) have been produced during the period of review.

vi) An outline of the main objectives and activities 2009-2013 - the University and Faculty Strategic Plan identified research as an area of strategic importance. Educational research was highlighted as a priority; the objective being to promote cutting-edge, applied and practice-based research within a range of theoretical and methodological perspectives to inform policy and practice at local, national and international level. The University aimed to develop a robust research culture and infra-structure. The five Research Centres have been instrumental in co-ordinating the submission to REF 2014. All academic staff members of the Faculty align themselves with at least one centre and centres develop research across the Faculty and beyond.

To support the centres, Centre Directors are given two days per week for centre management duties and are also asked to identify one period per month to conduct meetings/ seminars. The Research Director meets regularly with the Centre Directors to monitor progress and ensure the wider Faculty and University research agenda is adhered to.

vii) Future developments and initiatives of strategic importance -The REF 2020 will be based on the achievements of the Centres and the structure of the Strategic Research Plan. The research programmes for each Centre underpin future development of the Faculty's research. The Strategic Research Plan will review the work of all Centres across the university with a view to rationalising and extending their work and to give them a clear role within the University. Centres are to become more multi-disciplinary and will engage staff from more than one Faculty. The functions of the Centres will ensure impact of research is developed more consistently, sponsor higher degrees and act as a focal point for research activities including developing and supporting bid applications; developing QA systems for research, sponsoring research seminars and conferences at national and international levels.

c. People: Staffing strategy and staff development - The University staffing policy is designed to reward all-round high-level contribution from staff. Research excellence is a key criterion for promotion. Staff may apply annually for Senior Lectureships (Grade 8) and biennial for Associate & full Professorship (Grades 9 and 10 respectively). The Faculty also promotes and supports research in a number of practical and conceptual ways [*detailed below*]. Staff at Lecturer and Senior Lecturer levels without a doctoral qualification (or an equivalent level of research training and experience) have to pursue doctoral study to enable continuation of employment. New appointments within the Faculty are made from staff who hold a doctorate in education or a cognate area. All staff are provided with mentoring by senior researchers aimed at ensuring that such colleagues become researchers of international standing. The University has developed a culture which acknowledges and celebrates research achievements and provides opportunities for further training and support at all levels and across faculties. The PVC provides leadership and support in research and postgraduate programmes and has responsibility for quality assurance in postgraduate research. The University, in partnership with the Faculties provides training for research supervisors, induction programmes for new supervisors, a comprehensive range of doctoral research skills training matched to Vitae's Researcher Development Framework. Face-to-face training is complemented by investment of £15,000 per year in Research Skills Online, a collection of online learning modules developed by a consortia of UK universities. The PVC and his offices are responsible for the University's Research Strategy, providing information and support for research active staff, including, research funding applications and grant management. Since 2010, the University Library has made an ongoing commitment to provide resources specifically for research. Approx. £30,000 per annum is spent on a variety of online tools to support researchers in for example finding funding, identifying calls for papers and calculating citation metrics.

The University's generic programme of research support is complemented at Faculty level via:

- staff development- conference attendance budget (approx. £10,000 per annum for the Research Centres) annual staff allowance to support conference attendance;
- [from 2010], a dedicated research Faculty librarian supporting staff and research students;
- University funding streams e.g. equipment fund; doctorate into publication fund, REF fund for academic staff who need some support in realising/development their REF 2014 submission;
- allocation of research time within the University's workload model;
- annual monitoring of research, which evaluates individuals' and Faculty priorities; and,
- provision of well-equipped offices for all research active staff.

The Faculty has kept provision for research staff under review in the light of the University's Probationary Arrangements and Career Management Scheme. Every Faculty Supervisor undertakes appropriate training through tailored courses offered within the Faculty, or more general provision by the University. During the Review Period staff were eligible to receive financial support for study towards a part-time Masters, PhD and Ed.D. During this time, 23 research staff have been appointed to Lectureships in the Faculty, four to a Senior Lectureship, two to Associate Professors. In addition, of the 30 post-doctoral teaching fellows 24 have successfully completed their post-doctoral year and moved to permanent contracts. This figure represents the Faculty and University's commitment to develop its staffing base to ensure the high caliber staff are retained.

2012 witnessed the creation of the **Faculty Extended Study Period Policy**. All established staff can 'bid' twice a year to take sabbatical leave ranging from a few week to two terms.

ii) The Faculty research strategy is also supported by the employment of Adjunct Professors who hold (or have held) senior appointments at other universities and who are known for research excellence (normally at Professorial level).

iii) Research students - The University and Faculty Strategic Plan has led to a recruitment drive which has resulted in a **marked increase in recruitment of PhD and Ed.D students**). During this period, there have been 5.5 successful PhD completions. All research students (PhD and EdD) attend a mandatory induction programme on research methods and ethics and a continuing programming of training organised both at Faculty and Institutional level. A major achievement since 2009 is the development of the **Professional Doctorate Programme**. Launched in 2010 it has generated powerful potential for growing research output in professional contexts. The first students will complete studies in 2014 and the programme currently has 22 students. It is managed by Dr. Green and is aimed at education professionals who want to conduct extensive professionally based research projects. One of drivers of the programme is the development of applied research in education. In this respect, the Professional Doctorate Programme responds to a need identified at regional and national level, and has established itself as a niche provider in the area of applied and practice-related research. Current issues under investigation are, for example, 'The Internationalisation of Higher Education: What are the effects of British University style assessments upon the learning of Singapore-based students?' and 'Fusing the complexity of 'synergy' and 'dissonance' in the pursuit of coherence and transformation through Middle Leadership in secondary schools.'

c. Income - Continued external and internal funding then has enabled not only to be sustained, but also to be significantly developed. The Faculty has been successful in securing a mixed portfolio of project/research income [e.g. for the first time - *British Academy and UK Research Council, Natural Environment Research Council and the Engineering and Physical Science Research Council*]. The Faculty expects all research-active staff to identify sources of external funding and to submit one bid a year. Research income and outputs are observed to be a normal part of an academic staff member's role and form an integral part of the annual performance review process. This emphasis on bidding for funding has observed an increase in applications during the period of review. **External research funding** has, during the review period supported 15 research projects [e.g. *Dr Green NICER – What If Learning Project; Prof. Atkin-NERC, Rural Hybrid Energy Enterprise. Bignold NERC Funding Ecosystems Services of Poverty Alleviation*]. This increase has facilitated extension of the existing infra-structure and allowed a development of strengths in the field of applied and practice-based research. This research has been supported through a large number of partnerships that exist within and outside the University such as collaborative links with schools, HEIs and educational organisations which has led to research being embedded in local, regional and national networks. The impact of these developments is evidenced in increased outputs whose quality is reflected in terms of their international recognition and excellence.

Infrastructure & Facilities - The Faculty encourages a sense of community and communication through the creation of a supportive and inspiring environment which is inclusive of all doctoral students and staff. The developments outlined below represent the University commitment to developing world class research – not just through recruiting more academic staff and research students but also in developing high class research environments. The core education library collection comprises 110,000 print books and monographs (including 50,000 unique titles). This is complemented by a dedicated research collection containing 30,000 books and pamphlets on all aspects of education but particularly from an historic viewpoint and special and religious education. There are also collections of bibliographies, government publications, statistical publications, and annual reports of organisations connected with education. In addition to an extensive print archive of educational journals, there is an online collection of over 2,000 full text journals. This is also a wealth of relevant full text online journal content in related disciplines such as Psychology, Sociology, Theology and Social Work. In 2012 a major refurbishment of the library was completed. This refurbishment, based upon the feedback from students, witnessed, for the first time, the creation of a dedicated post-graduate research centre within the library. This suite of bookable offices comprises of four individual offices and a fully equipped IT laboratory. The virtual learning environment, at the University, hosts a section which enables all doctoral students a central point

Environment template (REF5)

of contact. [For example, documentation, useful links, the Vitae skills programme, news of research via forums and messages].

d. Collaboration or contribution to the discipline or research base

Research collaborations exist at international, national and local levels with a range of research users and community partners. **Examples of international collaborations are:** *CfID* is part of the Rural Hybrid Energy Enterprise Systems (RHEES) Project. RHEES is a multinational and multidisciplinary project bringing together academics and researchers from institutions of higher education across the world. The project has been co-funded by the Department of Science and Technology (DST) in India and Engineering and Physical Science Research Council (EPSRC) UK under the collaborative research initiative in *Bridging the Urban Rural Divide*. RHEES involves six universities in the UK and eight institutions in India. As a co-participant of the consortium, Liverpool Hope represents the Social Science group. The Centre also works in China on - Ecosystem Services for Poverty Alleviation- funded by NERC, the Chinese Government and our Department for International Development. In addition, the Centre regularly hosts the Moral Studies Association International Colloquium. The *NCfCE* worked with Canterbury Christ Church University on a project which evaluated the impact on teaching and learning of using the '*What If Learning Approach*'. This approach developed through an international partnership involving teachers in the UK, Australia and the USA under the sponsorship of the *Transforming Lives* programme (www.transforminglives.org.uk). Its aim is to support classroom teachers in developing a distinctively Christian approach to teaching and learning which is appropriate for publicly-funded schools. The *CfCFS* hosted a Lecturer from China during 2011-2012 who studied action research. The Scholarship was funded by the Chinese Government. The *CfDCS* hosted Doat a PH.d. researcher from the Centre of Medical Ethics, Lille Catholic University in France. The centre's Director is Executive Editor of the international *JLCDS*. Its editorial board consists of 50 international scholars.

Examples of national collaborations are: The *CfCFS* engaged in collaborative inquiry with Liverpool City Council. Practitioner-research projects within Liverpool, supported by the inquiry, have influenced practice of staff from early years settings, and from other settings for children. The *NCfCE* collaborated with the Archdiocese of Dublin to evaluate a Pastoral Worker Programme - The Impact of a Distinctively Christian Ethos on Teaching and Learning [Budget from Jerusalem and Church college trust]. They also evaluated a training programme for lay parish pastoral workers to work alongside priests of the Archdiocese of Dublin. The Director of the *CfCDS* collaborated with a Professor Goodley, with the organisation of an international colloquium, *Theorising Culture and Disability* (MMU, 2008), and culminating in a guest edited issue of the *Review of Disability Studies* (University of Hawai'i at Manoa, 2010). The 'Liverpool Hope University Studies in Ethics Series' is an interdisciplinary, mission-related university research project devoted to the study of applied ethics, has eleven volumes published to date. Four volumes have emerged already from the Faculty of Education, contributions are from external as well as internal academics ranging from professorial level to early researchers. The volumes are: *Engaging Religious Education* (Vol.1); *Reservoirs of Hope: Sustaining Spirituality in School Leaders* (Vol.2); *Professional Ethics: Education for a Humane Society* (Vol.7); and *Catholic Education: Universal Principles, Locally Applied* (Vol. 8). Dr. David Torevell (returned to Unit 33) is the Series Editor.

Internal University Collaborations: The *CfAP* & the *NCfCE* conducting an analysis of OFSTED reports. This research intends to identify the key characteristics of faith based schools which helps to determine their enhanced status. The *CfAP* with Higher Education (HEA) Academy ran the Discipline Workshop & Seminar Series, 2012-2013. 'Re-energising undergraduate research methods in education. The *CfIDE* is collaborating with the Education Studies subject team by supporting members in a HEA funded project examining internationalisation. The *CfCDS* hosted a dissemination event for Dr Claire Molloy, from the Faculty of Arts and Humanities entitled *Avatar and the Colonization of Bodies*.