### Institution: University of Bristol

# REF2014 Research Excellence Framework

# Unit of Assessment: UoA 32 Philosophy

#### a. Overview

The Department of Philosophy is exceptionally active and successful in research in many areas of philosophy and is internationally recognised for its excellence. It is located within a multidisciplinary school, and has very strong links with other departments, schools and research centres in the University. These include the Schools of Economics, Experimental Psychology, Law, Mathematics, Physics, Sociology, Politics and International Studies, and Social and Community Medicine, as well as the Centre for Science and Philosophy, the Cabot Institute, the Elizabeth Blackwell Institute and the Institute for Advanced Studies. Interdisciplinary collaboration is a distinctive feature of research in this UoA. Many staff in the unit have specific expertise in other disciplines and have co-authored papers and collaborated on research projects with colleagues in other subjects; two have joint appointments with departments in other faculties (Science; Medicine and Dentistry). This facilitates the Department's strong research and teaching programmes in fields such as philosophy of medicine, logic, set theory, and philosophy of mathematics. Members of the department have been exceptionally successful securing grants to fund projects running in the REF period with a total value of over £3M; these include two major ERC grants, three large AHRC research grants, and British Academy and Leverhulme Trust grants among others. The many international conferences associated with the various projects have brought a large number of eminent visitors, and many more have visited the department seminar or for research meetings and for longer visits. The various seminar series and reading groups and the strong postgraduate community make for an extremely lively and rich research environment. Many excellent young philosophers have enjoyed periods as visiting students, researchers, or teaching fellows at Bristol. The department is proud of its outstanding record in placing PGRs and fixed-term staff in high quality academic jobs.

#### b. Research strategy

The strategic aims for research during the assessment period as described in RAE2008 were (i) to maintain and strengthen the exceptional performance and success of the philosophy of science, logic and mathematics group within the department, (ii) to develop the department's capacity in medical humanities and (iii) to boost the department's strength in value theory. Within the REF2014 period, (i) has been achieved by the appointments of Richard Pettigrew and Kentaro Fujimoto; success in capturing large grants, with 8 postdocs, in this area; the establishment of the Centre for Science and Philosophy supporting collaborations between philosophers and scientists/mathematicians; bringing many visiting scholars in philosophy of science, logic and mathematics to Bristol (see also sections below). It was also achieved by the capture of several large grants in the philosophy of science, in particular AHRC and ERC grants led by Samir Okasha in collaboration with Ken Binmore, connecting the fields of philosophy of biology, evolutionary game theory, and decision theory. Objective (ii) was achieved by the appointment of Havi Carel to a Senior Lectureship and of Gareth Williams to a Senior Research Fellowship; the department leads (with English) the Faculty Research Cluster in Medical Humanities; it leads an additional Medical Humanities series (funded by BIRTHA and the Elizabeth Blackwell Institute for Health Research), and it has hosted several conferences and workshops in philosophy of medicine. Objective (iii) was achieved by the appointments of Joanna Burch-Brown and Havi Carel, and by parallel appointments in political philosophy and the history of political thought in the School of Sociology, Politics and International Relations.

While our aims for the period have been achieved to our satisfaction, our future strategic aims will not diverge radically from this successful path. We will build on the current strategy and maintain our diversity of activity. We plan to consolidate and develop the world-leading position of the philosophy of science, mathematics and logic group, to develop medical humanities further, and to enhance the value theory group. The Centre for Science and Philosophy will play a central role in the first two, promoting interdisciplinary research with scientists and also providing a home for



collaborations with external scholars and institutions, especially those from overseas. We will also make an appointment in the philosophy of mind and psychology in 2013–14. Medical humanities will continue to develop its research programmes, in collaboration with the new Elizabeth Blackwell Institute for Health Research and will build on past success with the Wellcome Trust to seek funds for larger projects. Growing our strength in value theory is a priority, and we will make an additional appointment in 2013–14, while seeking larger collaborative grants to build our profile and activity in ethics, political philosophy, and aesthetics, as well as history of philosophy.

The department has prided itself on a very active research culture, with many conferences workshops, seminars series, and reading groups (see section e). The culture is egalitarian, encompassing PGs and interested UGs. An important aim has been to increase grant income (see section d), in order to enlarge this research activity and to bring more philosophers (postdocs, PGs, and visitors) to Bristol. We have recently added an important international dimension to this strategy. While our research culture has always attracted individual international visitors (see section c), we have recently begun to develop more formal, longer-term relationships with departments overseas. So far we have forged such relationships with Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität, Munich (Munich Centre for Mathematical Philosophy) and Kyoto University. In the coming years we will seek to add such international connections.

For much of the REF period the department has been housed in two separate buildings. A major aim of the last three years was to find a single home, to support the strong sense of intellectual community and close contact between staff, students and visitors. In July 2013 we moved to a grand new building, Cotham House, which will accommodate all philosophy staff and the Centre for Science and Philosophy, and will enhance our thriving research culture.

We believe that the success of our current strategy (and the likely success of its continuation in the future) are evidenced by the success of our graduate students (see section c.ii); the success of fixed-term and permanent staff in developing their careers (section c.1); success in grant capture (section d); and the use of our resources to create a very active research culture that has national and international reach (sections c, d, and e). It is also evidenced by the success of individual researchers in gaining fellowships (section d) and in winning prizes and achieving other marks of international recognition (most notably, Samir Okasha's Lakatos Prize (2009), the most prestigious prize in the philosophy of science).

# c. People, including:

#### i. Staffing strategy and staff development

The complement of the department is currently 14.3 FTEs permanent members of staff: Christopher Bertram (Professor), Alexander Bird (Professor), Joanna Burch-Brown (Lecturer), Havi Carel (Senior Lecturer, 0.8 philosophy, 0.2 social and community medicine), Anthony Everett (Senior Lecturer), Kentaro Fujimoto (Lecturer, 0.5 philosophy, 0.5 mathematics), Leon Horsten (Professor), James Ladyman (Professor), Michelle Montague (Lecturer), Seiriol Morgan (Senior Lecturer), Samir Okasha (Professor), Giles Pearson (Senior Lecturer), Richard Pettigrew (Reader), Andrew Pyle (Reader), Finn Spicer (Senior Lecturer). There are currently three fixed-term teaching fellows: Dagmar Wilhelm, Jonathan Grose and Giulia Terzian. The department hosts two postdoctoral research fellows, Tomasz Bigaj (Marie Curie) and Ryan Samaroo (Canadian Social Sciences Research Council); five postdoctoral research assistants on projects, David Crawford, Jason Konek, Ben Levinstein, Johannes Martens, and Stuart Presnell; and four senior research fellows, Gareth Williams (medicine), Ken Binmore (economics), John Mayberry (mathematics) and Carolyn Wilde (retired Senior Lecturer, aesthetics), who take an active part in the research environment of the department.

In accordance with the Concordat to Support the Career Development of Researchers and the Concordat to Support Research Integrity, staff are fully supported by the University, Faculty and School at all stages of their careers. The career development of all members of staff, especially with regard to research, is supported by (i) Annual staff development review from the Head of Subject, a central component of which is the Annual Research Review. Focussed on a detailed



form, this involves discussion of each individual's plans for research, publication, grant applications, and engagement and impact activities. This review is particularly intensive for younger members of staff. (ii) Mentoring for all junior staff (permanent and fixed-term). (iii) Centrally organised career development courses. (iv) Training in writing grants, public engagement and impact, support for networking, and research induction for new staff, organised by the Faculty of Arts Research Team. (v) Generous research leave (1 year in every 5). The success of these support mechanisms is shown by (a) success in grant capture (see below, section d), (b) rapid promotion of permanent staff (since 2008: Professorship—Horsten, and Readerships—Linnebo, Pettigrew), and (c) the success of fixed-term staff in securing prestigious posts on leaving Bristol.

The placement of fixed-term staff in excellent research and teaching posts after leaving Bristol is evidence of the supportive career development we provide and of our dynamic research culture: Michael Bresalier: research fellowships at Manchester and Imperial, now Wellcome Trust research fellow at King's College, London; Nivedita Gangopadhyay: Postdoctoral Researcher at University of Copenhagen; Naomi Goulder: Senior Lecturer at New College of the Humanities; Phyllis Illari McKay: Postdoctoral Fellowships at Kent and Hertfordshire, now Lecturer at UCL; Michael Madary: PDRA at Johannes Gutenberg-Universität, Mainz; Toby Meadows: Lecturer at Aberdeen; Cedric Paternotte: Research Fellow at LMU, Munich; Richard Pettigrew: Lecturer and now Reader at Bristol; Darrell Rowbottom: Junior Research Fellow at Oxford, now Associate Professor at Lingnan University, Hong Kong; Ulrich Stegmann: Lecturer at University of Aberdeen; Markus Schlosser: Research Fellow, University of Groningen; Emma Tobin: Lecturer at UCL; Jonathan Webber: Lecturer, now Reader at Cardiff.

The University of Bristol has a strong Equality and Diversity policy, which is fully implemented in the Faculty and this department in order to ensure fairness in recruitment and to support staff of all backgrounds at every stage of their subsequent careers. In particular, the Faculty Equalities Committee has developed policies to tackle gender imbalances and to support the careers of women in the Faculty. The Department of Philosophy has worked especially hard to mentor the women philosophers mentioned above and works closely with the Society for Women in Philosophy and the British Philosophical Association to inform its practices and improve its climate. The development of research and other skills of its newly-appointed lecturers is a high priority. They all attend the Faculty Induction programme and we aim to support them with (i) a reduction in teaching loads in the early years of appointment; (ii) ensuring early research leave—usually in the second or third year of appointment; (iii) close support and mentoring from the Head of Subject; (iv) encouraging and providing support for hosting workshops in their areas; and (v) active involvement of colleagues in reading and discussing their work.

The research culture of the department makes it attractive to international visiting researchers who come for extended periods, and whose presence enhances the department in turn: Dr Staffan Angere (Swedish Research Council postdoctoral research fellow, 2011–2013); Prof Scott Berman (St Louis University, 2011–12); Prof. Tomasz Bigaj (Warsaw University, Marie Curie Fellow 2009– 10 and 2013–14); Dr Francesca Boccuni (British Academy post-doctoral visiting fellow, 2008–09); Prof. Antonio Casado da Rocha (University of the Basque County, 2013); Prof. Arantza Etxeberria (University of the Basque County, 2013); Prof. José Falguera (University of Santiago de Compostela, 2009–10); Dr Toby Meadows (Maris Curie Fellow, joint with School of Mathematics); Dr Ryan Samaroo (Canadian Social Sciences Research Council postdoctoral research fellow, 2013–15); Dr Rafal Urbaniak (University of Ghent 2010–11). Similarly, the research culture makes the department a prime desination for leading international scholars visiting for shorter periods, including, Hartry Field, Branden Fitelson, Ian Hacking, Jim Joyce, L. A. Paul, and Kim Sterelny.

#### ii. Research students

The department has pursued the policy outlined in RAE2008 of first increasing the size of the PGR cohort, and then maintaining a steady number (30–40) while increasing quality. The success of our recruitment, training, and PGR environment is shown by (i) students with external funding and scholarships (see below) (ii) the success of our students in gaining prestigious postdoctoral positions, and (see below) (iii) the number of high quality PGRs (the number of doctorates awarded per annum has increased fourfold compared to RAE2008, from 1.3 to 5.3).



Research students are carefully supported, with annual progress reports and an intensive process overseeing their upgrade from MLitt to candidate PhD status. The Graduate School of Arts and Humanities provides centralised support for PGRs, including working space, computer and social facilities, housed immediately adjacent to the Department of Philosophy. Both the Graduate school and Department provide training to support teaching, research, and career development, including research proposal writing and applying for jobs. Philosophy postgraduates hold their own weekly work-in-progress seminar, and participate on an equal basis in the Departmental work-in-progress seminar, as well as being invited to attend all research events in the department and faculty.

We have also been extremely successful in winning external funding for doctoral students. Two candidates of the current cohort were awarded full scholarships by The Darwin Trust of Edinburgh in the same year, which is a unique achievement, and two have held the extremely competitive British Society for the Philosophy of Science doctoral scholarships during the period of assessment. Two doctoral students were awarded RIP Jacobsen fellowships for 2011–12, and another was awarded an Analysis studentship for 2012-13. In addition, doctoral students have been funded by studentships attached to grants, including two on the AHRC 'Foundations of Structuralism' project, one on the AHRC 'Evolution, Cooperation and Rationality' project, two on the ERC 'Epistemic Utility Theory' project, and one on the ERC 'Darwinism and the Theory of Rational Choice' project. One doctoral student per year receives AHRC funding via the AHRC BGP.

The department has hosted doctoral students from all over the world and from a wide range of backgrounds and ethnic groups; for example we have research students from Kenya, Turkey, and Mexico. A number of these have brought prestigious funding from their home countries, including Aaron Guthrie on an Australian McArthur scholarship, Haktan Akcin on a scholarship from the Turkish government, and Carlos Gutierrez on a scholarship from the Mexican government.

The department prides itself on the success of its former students in gaining prestigious postdoctoral research posts and teaching posts: Mazviita Chirimuuta: Assistant Professor at Pittsburgh; Christopher Clarke: Research Associate, Department of History and Philosophy of Science, Cambridge (2012–15); Ellen Clarke: Fellow, All Souls College, Oxford (2011–16); Zoe Drayson: postdoctoral fellowship at Australian National University (2011–12), now research fellow at the University of Stirling; Simone Duca; postdoctoral fellow (joint appointment) at Ruhr University, Bochum and Heinrich Heine University, Dusseldorf (2010-11) and at LMU, Munich (2011–12); Matt Farr: postdoctoral fellowship at the University of Sydney (2012–14); Jonathan Grose: postdoctoral research assistantships then teaching fellowships at Bristol (2008–14); Stavros Ioannidis: postdoctoral fellowship at the University of Athens (2013-14); Mirasaeid Mousavi Karimi: Lecturer, now Assistant Professor at Sharif University of Technology, Tehran (2011–); Momo Liu: Lecturer, Shanghai University of Engineering Science (2013–); Dean Machin: Leverhulme Research Fellow at Warwick (2009–12); Alex Malpass: teaching fellow at Glasgow (2012–13): Marianna Antonutti Marfori: teaching fellow at Keele (2013–14); Elina Pechlivanidi: postdoctoral fellowship at the University of Athens (2013–14); Giulia Terzian: Teaching Fellow at Bristol; Alex Tillas: Postdoctoral research assistant, Heinrich Heine Universität, Düsseldorf; David Walker: teaching fellow at St Andrews (2009-11).

Our students have published prodigiously—the following is only a partial, indicative list: Matt Farr and Milena Ivanova co-edited a special issue of *Studies in History and Philosophy of Modern Physics*—Ivanova had published 5 articles before completing her PhD; Zoe Drayson published 3 articles, including "Embodied cognitive science and its implications for psychopathology" in *Philosophy, Psychiatry & Psychology* (2009); Tony Lamb has a book published, *The Ethics and Law of War: The moral justification of legal norms* (Routledge, 2013). Megan Blomfield "Global Common Resources and the Just Distribution of Emission Shares" in the *Journal of Political Philosophy* (2013); Alex Malpass "A Future for the Thin Red Line" in *Synthese* (2012); Chris Gifford "Against the Modal Argument" in *Erkenntnis* (2012). Current student Geoff Blumenthal has published 4 articles, including "Diplomacy, Patronage, and the Preface to *De Revolutionibus*" *Journal for the History of Astronomy* (2013). During the assessment period, our research students have organised, attracted internal and external funding for, and hosted two internationally attended conferences: 'Branching Time and Indeterminacy', 25–6.08.10 (proceedings published in Synthese



2012); and 'Postgraduate Conference on Conventional Principles in Science', 18–19.08.12. They have also co-organised others with Bristol staff and with students at other institutions: 'Explaining Religion', 2–3.09.10; and 'First Workshop of the Experimental Philosophy Group UK', 15.09.10, respectively. 'Explaining Religion' was an interdisciplinary event, co-hosted with the Bristol Cognitive Development Centre.

# d. Income, infrastructure and facilities

During the 2008–13 period, the department has increased its per annum research income (REF4b), in comparison to 2001–7 (RA4) by a factor of 6.6, from £64k to £425k. The department uses its grant-funded projects to organise workshops and conferences, to bring overseas philosophers to the UK, and to develop international collaborations. (All PI unless stated.):

*Bertram*: 'Theories of Territory: Resource Rights, Global Justice and Self-Determination' Network Grant (€40,000 IRCHSS/AHRC Bilateral Networking Grant) (Co-I).

*Bird* 'Metaphysics of Science' (£748,000 AHRC); 'Quantdisposition – Philosophy of Quantum Mechanics and the Metaphysics of Dispositional Properties' (£105,000 ERC) (with Co-I Bigaj); 'Scientific Knowledge' (£47,700 AHRC); 'Progress in Medicine conference' (£9,900 Wellcome Trust, Mind Association, BSPS, Aristotelian Society).

Carel: British Academy Mid-Career Fellowship (£73,000).

Doyle: Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton, Visiting Fellowship (£31,400).

Horsten: 'The Limits and Scope of Mathematical Knowledge' (with Prof. Philip Welch,

Mathematics) (Templeton Foundation, £46,000).

*Ladyman*: 'The Foundations of Structuralism' (with Co-Is Horsten, Pettigrew, Everett, and Linnebo) (£380,000 AHRC); 'Applying Homotopy Type Theory' (£180,000 Leverhulme Trust).

*Leitgeb*: 'Metacognition as a precursor to self-consciousness: evolution, development and epistemology' (£85,000 ESF/AHRC Eurocores CNCC Scheme); Philip Leverhulme Prize (£35,000).

*Linnebo*: 'Plurals, Predicates, and Paradox: Towards a Type-Free Account' (€ 940,862, ERC; project transferred to Birkbeck); 'New Waves in Philosophy of Mathematics' (£1,500 British Academy); Visiting Fellowship (Fancesca Boccuni) (£6,163, British Academy); Visiting Fellowship Rafal Urbaniak (British Academy, £4,470); 'Reference and Frege's Context Principle' (£2,291). *Montague*: AHRC Early Career Fellowship (£25,306).

*Okasha*: 'Evolution, Co-operation and Rationality' (£540,000, AHRC); Mind Association Research Fellowship (£39,700); 'Darwinism and the Theory of Rational Choice' (€960,000, ERC). Pearson: 'Aristotle on Desire' AHRC Research Leave Award (£26,000).

*Pettigrew*: AHRC Early Career Fellowship 'Accuracy and Epistemic Deference' (£35,659); British Academy Postdoctoral Fellowship 'Finding the Foundations for Natural and Real Number Arithmetic in a Theory of Finite Sets' (£185,500) (with Bird PI); 'Epistemic Utility Theory:

Foundations and Applications' (€950,000 ERC).

*Spicer*: 'Consciousness in Interaction: The Role of the Natural and Social Environment in Shaping Consciousness' (£180,000 ESF/AHRC).

Williams: Wellcome Trust Travel Grant (£2,000 Wellcome Trust).

The infrastructure to support research at Bristol is very extensive:

• Institute for Advanced Studies (IAS) supports major university research initiatives, interdisciplinary collaborations, and funds internal research fellowships and visiting research fellowships and professorships. The IAS has awarded three University Research Fellowships to philosophers (Pyle, Morgan, and Bertram). It awarded a Meaker visiting professorship to Prof. Ian Hacking (October 2013). The IAS also provided the initial funding and support for the Centre for Science and Philosophy.

• Bristol Institute for Research in the Humanities and Arts (BIRTHA) is a Faculty institute supporting research centres as well as individuals. Its annual budget of £30k funds visiting lectureships, conferences and workshops for both staff and postgraduates (including administrative support), and research grants to groups and individuals for interdisciplinary projects. In addition it administers the Faculty Conference, Publication and Research fund; staff can apply for up to £1800 p.a. for reimbursement of research expenses.



• Research and Enterprise Development (RED). The faculty employs two Research Development Managers whose role is to publicise new initiatives and possibilities in funding, alert and match staff to them and provide support during the application process. Further faculty support is provided by in-house peer review of applications through a Research Excellence Advisory Panel (REAP), dedicated support in costings from an excellent Faculty Finance Team and support in developing impact, knowledge exchange and knowledge transfer from RED staff. Development of new grant proposals is additionally supported through seedcorn and pump-priming funding provided by the Faculty Research Director.

• *University Research Theme.* The Department of Philosophy led the interdisciplinary University Research Theme "Science, Knowledge and Reality".

• The Graduate School of Arts and Humanities. Opened in 2009 the GSAH brings together, in one place, all the training and administrative support for postgraduates in the Faculty, and sponsors many academic and social events. Housed in its own building, it has become the bustling centre of postgraduate life in the Faculty. The Graduate School also hosts BIRTHA and Faculty Research Team, integrating research support across both staff and PGRs.

• School and Department. The School of Arts overseas the leave rota and the Deputy Head of Research in the School and Head of Subject assist staff in applying for research leave and external funding. Applications out of rota are allowed in order to conduct major projects. Further small sums of pump priming and seedcorn funding are available from the Head of School and Head of Subject's discretionary accounts.

*Cotham House* In July 2013 the department moved to a magnificent detached 19<sup>th</sup> century industrialist's villa. It houses all permanent and temporary staff and has separate staff and student common rooms, two kitchens, and the department library which has thousands of books and journals available to philosophy students to borrow. It also hosts the numerous reading groups organised by staff and students. There is a lecture room and a large seminar room for the department's exclusive use.

*Centre for Science and Philosophy* In 2012 we launched a new Centre for Science and Philosophy in collaboration with the Institute of Advanced Studies, with funding from the University Research Committee (£5K) and the Vice-Chancellor (£15K). The Centre is central to the research strategy outlined above, in particular by forging links with scientists, mathematicians, and medics. It also hosts visiting scholars in these fields, and is thereby becoming a hub for international collaborations. It has already hosted several conferences. For example, in May 2013, the Centre hosted a major conference, 'Evolution, Intentionality and Information', with plenary speakers including Dan Dennett, Evelyn Fox-Keller, Sahotra Sarkar, and Eva Jablonka.

The department's research culture is enhanced by several weekly research seminar and lecture series, as well as numerous reading groups (open to all): (i) Departmental Research Seminar (principal visiting speaker series); (ii) Specialist research seminars in: Philosophy and History of Science, Medicine, Medical Humanities, Mathematics, and Logic; (iii) Work in Progress Seminar (short talks by staff and by PGRs); (iv) Postgraduate Philosophy Seminars (PGRs only); (v) History of Philosophy Lectures (lunchtime lectures by staff on historical philosophers; these are supplementary to the curriculum). All seminars are open to all and widely advertised, and draw an audience from a broad range of disciplines, as well as members of the general public.

#### e. Collaboration or contribution to the discipline or research base

Collaboration with other subjects and institutions is central to the research strategy outlined above. Within Bristol, we have made joint appointments with other departments to make this concrete: Fujimoto with Mathematics and Carel with Social and Community Medicine. Close cooperation with Mathematics has been well-established for many years and is unique in the UK in being able to bring formal mathematical methods to bear fruitfully on philosophical problems. Externally, we have two annual joint workshops, with the Munich Centre for Mathematical Philosophy and with logicians and philosophers at Kyoto University. A major collaborative AHRC project (Metaphysics of Science), with Birmingham and Nottingham Universities, was hosted at Bristol.



Bristol philosophers have been very active in pursuing their responsibility to support philosophy by promoting philosophical activity and collaboration and by taking leadership roles within the profession, in a variety of ways (for example, the interdisciplinary blog *Crooked Timber*, involving philosophers, economists, sociologists, and political scientists, was set up at the initiative of Bertram in 2003; in 2008 *Crooked Timber* was listed as number 33 in *The Guardian's* list of the world's 50 most important blogs).

Leadership in national and international organizations Bird: Chair of the Philosophy sub-panel, REF2014; Carel: BPA Executive Committee, British Society for Phenomenology Executive Committee; Carel and Bird: BPA/SWIP Women in Philosophy Committee, International Philosophy of Medicine Roundtable Scientific Committee; Bertram: President of the Rousseau Association (until 2009); Okasha: Secretary for European Philosophy of Science Association (until 2009).

Editorial positions Until 2011, Ladyman and Bird edited The British Journal for the Philosophy of Science, the world's leading journal in its field according to ISI journal citation figures. Other editorships and memberships of editorial boards include: Carel, editorial board of the Film-Philosophy Journal; Horsten, associate editor for Studia Logica, editorial board for Logique et Analyse, and Thought; Ladyman, consulting editor for Episteme, editorial board for New Directions in the Philosophy of Science (Palgrave MacMillan); Bertram, correspondant à l'étranger of Raisons Politiques; Okasha, associate editor Philosophy of Science, associate editor for European Journal for Philosophy of Science, editorial board for Biology & Philosophy; Pettigrew, permanent referee panel for Thought, editorial board for Philosophy; and Pyle, editorial board for British Journal for the History of Philosophy.

*Examination of doctorates* In the REF period, members of the Department have been doctoral and habilitation examiners at the following universities: Australian National University, Amsterdam, Calgary, Cambridge, Cape Town, Durham, East Anglia, Geneva, Groningen, King's College London, Lancaster, Leeds, Manchester, Melbourne, LSE, Oxford, Paris, Reading, St Andrews, Sussex, Tilburg, University College London.

Organisation of conferences and events Since 01/01/2008 the department has hosted 46 conferences and workshops (http://www.bristol.ac.uk/philosophy/department/events/), ranging from PGR conferences and workshops advancing sharply defined topics (e.g. 'Abstraction/Criteria of Identity', 'Methodology in Climate Science' and 'Illness, Narrative and Phenomenology') to major international and state-of-the-art conferences (e.g. 'Structuralism in Physics and Mathematics', 'Evolution, Cooperation and Rationality', and 'Progress in Medicine'). Some of these are funded by project grants, others by charities and subject associations (Wellcome Trust, Mind Association etc.), and others by internal funding, especially for PG conferences. We regard these events as opportunities to enhance philosophy in the UK, to promote research internationally, and to bring interesting scholars, at all career stages, to Bristol and to the UK.

*Refereeing of academic publications or research proposals* All members of the Department regularly referee papers for leading journals, and book manuscripts for academic presses and conference submissions. They also assess grant applications for national and international bodies including: AHRC, ESRC, European Research Council, European Science Foundation, Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia (FCT) (Portuguese funding council), Fund for Scientific Research (Belgium), Irish Research Council, John Templeton Foundation, Leverhulme Trust, Wellcome Trust, Austrian Science Fund, Canadian Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council, National Research Foundation (South Africa), National Research Foundation of Korea, National Science Foundation (US), Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research, Research Grant Council of Hong Kong, Royal Society of New Zealand, Swiss National Science Foundation.

Advising on senior academic appointments and on reviews of research Members of the department have advised on professorial appointments, on tenure reviews, and reviews of research strategy at the following institutions: Bucknell, Buffalo, Edinburgh, Leuven, Manchester, Nebraska, Northern Illinois, Nottingham, Reading, Saint Louis, Stirling, Swarthmore, and Toronto.