

Institution: Glasgow Caledonian University

Unit of Assessment: 19 Business and Management

Title of case study: Occupational Segregation and the Scottish Modern Apprenticeship (MA) Programme

1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words)

The research led directly to:

- The establishment of a Scottish Government working group on occupational segregation and a government priority to tackle occupational segregation.
- The publication of gender disaggregated data on MAs.
- A renewed consideration by the Scottish Government of the need for a national strategy to tackle occupational segregation.
- A request by Scotland's First Minister to collaborate on a pilot project investigating gender barriers to the uptake of MAs in the renewable energy sector.
- Provision of expert evidence to parliamentary committees and government ministers.
- A partnership with Close the Gap which secured an ESRC Knowledge Exchange Opportunity Grant.

2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words)

The MA is a publicly funded training programme introduced in 1994 to address a lack of vocational skills amongst young people. It gives individuals the opportunity to combine employment and training by following an industry designed training framework. In 2003 the Equal Opportunities Commission (EOC) launched a General Formal Investigation (GFI) into the segregation of women and men in training and work. Under the Sex Discrimination Act (1975) the EOC had the power to investigate issues of gender inequality and discrimination. Following a GFI the EOC can make recommendations to any person or organisation, including government to change their practices and procedures in order to promote equality of opportunity. The GFI chose to focus on the MA programme to explore issues of gender based occupational segregation because the MA is the largest national training programme aimed at labour market entrants and commands significant public funding. The GFI concentrated on five of the most gender segregated employment sectors childcare, construction, plumbing, engineering and information and communication technology.

As the MAs operated differently in Scotland, a successful case was made by the GCU research team to the EOC for a separate study to be undertaken in Scotland (see Thomson et al, 2004) and the research team at GCU (Campbell, Gillespie, McKay and Thomson) secured substantial funding from the European Social Fund to carry out the GFI in Scotland. This research represented the first major study of the MA in Scotland from a gender perspective. The research team concluded that the segregation of women and men into different occupations has a damaging effect on the economy by failing to make the most efficient use of the potential workforce and holding back productivity. Furthermore, it contributes to the continuation of the gender pay gap and restricts individual career opportunities and choices by reinforcing gender stereotypes in the workplace. The research concluded that as the key national training programme, and often first point of entry into the labour market for young people, the MA provided an opportunity to challenge occupational segregation but in practice reinforced it.

The final report made a series of recommendations including the establishment of a national strategy for tackling occupational segregation in training and work and that data on MAs be disaggregated by gender and made available in the public domain. In 2008 the research team were commissioned by the EOC to update the research to track any progress that had been made



towards tackling occupational segregation within the MA programme.

The research team has continued to explore the issues around occupational segregation and apprenticeship training and have incorporated a comparative study by exploring apprenticeship training in Germany and England. Overall, this research activity has resulted in four refereed journal articles, five commissioned reports for the EOC and several invited contributions to government level discussions on occupational segregation, including the first ever Scottish Government sponsored Women's Employment Summit in 2012. All of this activity has established the research team as experts in the area of occupational segregation and apprenticeship training.

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

Thomson, E., McKay, A. & Gillespie, M. (2004) 'Modern Apprenticeships and Gender Based Occupational Segregation in Scotland: A Position Paper." Equal Opportunities Commission (Scotland)

Campbell, J, McKay A, Gillespie M, and Thomson E (2005) 'Jobs for the Boys and the Girls: Promoting a Smart, Successful and Equal Scotland.' The Final Report of the Scottish Component of the EOC's General Formal Investigation into Occupational Segregation. Equal Opportunities Commission (Scotland) February 2005

Campbell, J, McKay A and Thomson E (2005) 'How Modern is the Modern Apprenticeship?' Local Economy Vol. 20 No. 3

Campbell, J, McKay A and Thomson E (2006) 'From Gender Blind to Gender Focussed: Reevaluating the Scottish Modern Apprenticeship Programme' Scottish Affairs 57 Autumn 2006 Campbell J, Gillespie M, McKay A and Meikle A (2009) 'Jobs for the Boys and the Girls: Promoting a Smart Successful Scotland three years on' Scottish Affairs 66 Winter 2009 Campbell, J, Thomson. E, & Pautz, H (2011) 'Apprenticeship Training in England: Closing the Gap'

Journal of Contemporary European Studies Vol. 19 Issue 3 September 2011

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

In response to research team's recommendation to increase the transparency of gender disaggregated data, Scottish Enterprise and Highlands and Islands Enterprise (who were responsible for MAs at the time) began to publish gender disaggregated data on MAs on their websites. The responsibility for MAs was transferred to Skills Development Scotland (SDS) in 2008 and they now publish all data broken down by gender on their website.

Another of the key recommendations made by the research team was the establishment of a national strategy for tackling occupational segregation in training and work. Although the idea of a national strategy was rejected by the (then) Scottish Executive, they instead set up the Scottish Government Cross-Directorate Occupational Segregation Working Group in 2006 (see Macpherson 2008) as a focus for addressing occupational segregation in the labour market. As a result of the establishment of this group tackling occupational segregation has became a key feature of Scottish government policy. Scottish Ministers identified occupational segregation as one of two priority areas for the advancement of equality of opportunity between men and women, the other being violence against women.

In 2012, the first ever Women's Employment Summit (WES) was held by the Scottish Government in partnership with the Scottish Trades Unions Congress (STUC). Professor McKay gave a



keynote speech to the summit and was subsequently invited onto a Ministerial Governance Group to take forward the recommendations of the WES which agreed to revisit the original national strategy recommendation made by the research team. Through involvement in the WES and at the request of the First Minister, the research team are collaborating with the Scottish Government to bring forward a pilot project to address the gender barriers to the uptake of MAs in the renewable energy sector. This is regarded as a key sector for future growth in the Scottish economy and the Scottish government is keen to ensure that there is a suitability qualified workforce to take advantage of the opportunities growth in this sector will present.

Since the publication of the research in 2005, the research team have become recognised as experts in the area of occupational segregation and the MA programme. Emily Thomson was invited to speak on occupational segregation and the Scottish MA programme at the Apprenticeship and Training Summit in March 2011. In February 2012, the research was cited in the Scottish Parliament in an evidence session to the Equal Opportunities Commission. In March 2013 Professor McKay delivered a keynote speech on addressing occupational segregation at the Apprenticeship and Training Summit which was opened by the Minister for Youth Employment Angela Constance MSP.

The research has impacted on the priorities of Skills Development Scotland (SDS), who are responsible for the delivery of MAs. This is evidenced by their decision to offer a studentship sponsored with the ESRC through the Scottish Doctoral Training Programme to investigate gender and occupational segregation in MAs.

The research team has also recently been successful in a bid to the ESRC under the Knowledge Exchange Opportunity scheme on accounting for gender in the MA programme in Scotland. A key factor in securing the grant was the impact of previous research by the team. The bid was undertaken in partnership with Close the Gap an organisation which works across Scotland with employers and employees, to encourage and enable action to address the gender pay gap.

There is clear evidence that this research has impacted on policy change in respect to the setting up of the Occupational Segregation Working Group, increased transparency of publicly available data broken down by gender and in recognition of the research team as experts in the area. The impact has been significant in term of its reach, because of the published research outputs and there has been engagement at the highest level of government and the wider policy making community in Scotland. This engagement has ensured that the issue of occupational segregation and the potential of the MA programme to tackle it has remained a live issue. The impact has been sustained over a number of years and the research team has continued to influence the design and implementation of the MA programme in Scotland based on original and ongoing research.

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

Macpherson, S (2008), Tackling Occupational Segregation in Scotland: A Report of Activities from the Scottish Government Cross-Directorate Occupational Segregation Working Group Edinburgh: Employment Research Institute.

Scottish Government (2010) Reporting on Progress Towards Equality of Opportunity for Women and Men made by Public Authorities in Scotland.

http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/317198/0101035



Official Report of the Equal Opportunities Commission, 21st February 2012 available at http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/parliamentarybusiness/28862.aspx?r=7193&mode=pdf

Ministerial priorities available at http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/People/Equality/18500/OccSeg

Women's Employment Summit

http://www.employabilityinscotland.com/media/218898/women_s_employment_summit_-_pack_agenda.pdf

Chief Economic Advisor to the Scottish Government

Letter from the Minister for Youth Employment to Professor McKay

Project Manager, Close the Gap